Determinants Of Early Feeding Practices Among Hiv+ Mothers In Sub-Saharan Africa: A Realist Review

Camille Adrianne Pottinger
Yale University, capottinger@yahoo.com

Follow this and additional works at: http://elischolar.library.yale.edu/ysphtdl

Recommended Citation
http://elischolar.library.yale.edu/ysphtdl/1231

This Open Access Thesis is brought to you for free and open access by the School of Public Health at EliScholar – A Digital Platform for Scholarly Publishing at Yale. It has been accepted for inclusion in Public Health Theses by an authorized administrator of EliScholar – A Digital Platform for Scholarly Publishing at Yale. For more information, please contact elischolar@yale.edu.
Determinants of Early Feeding Practices among HIV+ Mothers in Sub-Saharan Africa: A realist review

By: Camille Pottinger, MPH 2015
Epidemiology of Microbial Diseases, Yale School of Public Health

May 1, 2015

Primary Thesis Advisor:
Debbie Humphries, Ph.D, MPH
Yale School of Medicine, Yale School of Public Health

Secondary Thesis Advisor:
Rafael Perez-Escamilla, Ph.D
Yale School of Public Health
ABSTRACT:

INTRODUCTION: Exclusive breastfeeding has been shown to provide many benefits that can be life saving for the infant and mother in low resource settings. Although the potential effects of breastfeeding appear large, exclusive breastfeeding rates remain low in this area of the world, and are even lower among the HIV population. It is important to understand what influences HIV+ mothers to exclusively breastfeed, as well as formula feed and adhere to ARV (antiretroviral) medication while breastfeeding in order to make comprehensive policy recommendations that are as culturally sensitive and practical as possible. The objective of this review is to understand the positive determinants that influence recommended early infant feeding practices such as exclusive breastfeeding and formula feeding among HIV+ mothers in SSA and adherence to ARVS when made available.

METHOD: A realist approach was chosen in order to determine what other factors can complement Prevention of Mother to Child Transmission (PMTCT) programs and the 2010 WHO Guidelines on HIV and Infant Feeding upon the decisions HIV+ mothers make in regards to infant feeding and how causal mechanisms can be shaped and constrained by social context. The literature search was iterative and ongoing throughout the project. A total of 23 articles were included for further analysis.

PRELIMINARY RESULTS: In terms of using ARV medication while breastfeeding, some determinants include: having self-efficacy, fear of MTCT, and having a good relationship with PMTCT counselors. For exclusively formula feeding, some determinants include: disclosure of status to family and support, being independent/ having flexibility in everyday routine, and being financially stable. For exclusively breast-feeding, some determinants include: fulfilling the role of a good mother, belief in breast milk having nutritious benefits, and making the choice antepartum.

CONCLUSIONS: In many sub-Saharan societies, exclusive breastfeeding is considered by far the best feeding option for HIV+ mothers. Strengthening and generalizing promotion of exclusive breastfeeding by first identifying the determinants that help to generate positive adherence at a policy and then community based level should be a major public-health priority both for the infant’s HIV-free survival and the mother’s welfare.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS:

Appreciation and much gratitude for their help and support are extended to the following persons who have contributed to making this thesis possible.

1. **Debbie Humphries, Ph.D, MPH**, for her role as my primary reader. For offering countless amount of support, guidance, and advice, especially in the area of bringing forth the idea of constructing a realist review and developing the Context-Mechanism-Outcome model during many meetings.

2. **Rafael Perez Escamilla, Ph.D**, for his role as my secondary reader. For offering much constructive criticism and insight for preliminary drafts.

3. **Janis Glover, MLS, AHIP**, for her assistance in conducting sophisticated literature searches which contributed to selecting my sample within my thesis.
**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

INTRODUCTION..........................................................................................................................5-7  
  Rationale for Review..............................................................................................................5-6  
  Objective(s)...........................................................................................................................7  
METHODS...................................................................................................................................7-9  
  Rationale for realist synthesis...............................................................................................7-8  
  Scope of Literature.................................................................................................................8  
  Search Process.......................................................................................................................8  
  Selection and Appraisal of Documents................................................................................8  
  Data Extraction......................................................................................................................9  
RESULTS.....................................................................................................................................9-13  
  Document of Flow Diagram.................................................................................................9  
  Document of Characteristics.................................................................................................9  
  Main Findings........................................................................................................................9-13  
DISCUSSION............................................................................................................................13-15  
  Summary of Findings...........................................................................................................13-14  
  Limitations.............................................................................................................................14  
  Comparison to existing literature.........................................................................................14  
POLICY IMPLICATIONS............................................................................................................15-16  
REFERENCES.........................................................................................................................17-20  
APPENDIX...............................................................................................................................21-34

**LIST OF CHARTS**

Chart 1. Early Infant Feeding Context Mechanism Model....................................................21  
Chart 2. Flow diagram illustrating search process and article disposition.........................22

**LIST OF TABLES**

Table 1. Demographic Information from each Inclusive Study............................................23-25  
Table 2. Methodological Characteristics from each Inclusive Study....................................25-27  
Table 3. Determinants of ARV Adherence while Breastfeeding............................................28  
Table 4. Determinants of Exclusive Formula Feeding.........................................................29-30  
Table 5. Determinants of Exclusive Breast Feeding............................................................31-34
INTRODUCTION:
Rationale for review:

In the context of HIV, exclusive breastfeeding while using ARVs would be the most effective in seeing decreased rates of mother to child transmission (MTCT) in Sub Saharan Africa (SSA). The guidelines recommend that mothers known to be HIV infected should be provided with lifelong ARV therapy or antiretroviral prophylaxis interventions. However, regardless of this recommendation, PMTCT programs that offer ARV therapy for the mother and child are still reporting low coverage of treatment. For example, the Buesseler and colleagues report on a cross sectional surveillance study that an overall nevirapine coverage estimate of 51% (n=3196) among 43 randomly selected sites in Cameroon, Cote d’Ivoire, South Africa, and Zambia. Additionally, Buesseler and colleagues reported on a cross sectional study in Cote d’Ivoire in which a survey of maternal infant single dose nevirapine found coverage to be low 24% (n=570) among 10 randomly selected facilities providing delivery services in Cote d’Ivoire. Most studies related to ARV therapy and breastfeeding are concerned about medication efficacy of vertical transmission rates rather than factors that affect whether or not a mother will adhere to the drug regimen which could make all the difference in understanding how to better communicate safer practices among this population.

The WHO Guidelines also recommend that HIV infected mothers can give infant formula milk as a replacement feed to their infants when Acceptable, Feasible, Affordable, Sustainable and Safe (AFASS) conditions are met. Exclusive formula feeding (EFF) does provide a safer mode for feeding in relation to HIV transmission. However, in the Sub-Saharan African context, most living situations do not meet the AFASS conditions, which can lead to higher rates of mortality.

Finally, in the context in which ARVs are not accessible or infant formula is not appropriate, the 2010 WHO Guidelines for HIV and Infant Feeding still recommends that mothers should exclusively breastfeed in the first six months of life and then introduce complementary foods thereafter, and continue breastfeeding the first 12 months of life. The choice of whether to breastfeed while HIV + is controversial as the mothers can still pass the infection down to her infant through this mode of feeding. Despite the high risk of transmission, breastfeeding is still the preferred means of infant feeding in developing countries.

Exclusive breastfeeding (EBF) has been shown to provide benefits to the infant such as a decreased risk in infant mortality, gastrointestinal infections, and respiratory infections; an increase in intellectual development; and benefits to the mother a decreased risk in fertility return, postpartum hemorrhage, and breast cancer; and an increase in bone health.

The Setty and colleagues reported on a prospective observational study conducted in Bangladesh that found infants who received partial or no breastfeeding were more than twice as likely to die before age one than infants who were exclusively breastfed for the first four months of life. Additionally, Setty and colleagues report on a study conducted in Brazil in which infants who were partially breastfed and those who were not breastfed had
a higher risk of developing pneumonia than for infants who were exclusively breastfed. Finally, Setty and colleagues report on one large study which found a reduced risk of breast cancer averaging 14% among women who ever breastfed compared with women who never breastfed.

Although the potential effects of breastfeeding appear large, breastfeeding rates are low, and are even lower among the HIV population in low resource settings8-10.

For example, in Malawi, it is estimated that the median duration of exclusive breastfeeding is 3.7 months. In some parts of Malawi, rates are as low as 19% at one month, and less than 5% at six months. This is true regardless of whether the mother is HIV-positive or HIV-negative. Nor and colleagues report on several studies conducted to determine EBF rates in low resource settings which are described as following. A secondary data analysis of Demographic and Health Survey of 2482 children in Bangladesh shows a 42.5% prevalence of EBF under 6 months. In Uganda, a dietary recall since birth have shown an EBF rate of only 7% by 3 months in spite of a strong breastfeeding culture. Similar trend has been documented in South Africa, where in 2009 a United Nations Children’s Fund (UNICEF) report on the state of world’s children found an EBF rate under 6 months of only 7% despite the fact that breastfeeding is the traditional feeding mode with majority (88%) of mothers initiating breastfeeding soon after birth.

When creating policies and interventions geared towards sensitive and stigmatizing topics such as HIV, it is important to not just assume that having knowledge of HIV transmission, the WHO Guidelines, or access to certain resources such as infant formula or ARVS will generate adherence for the most appropriate infant feeding type. Decisions can be more heavily impacted by the socio-cultural beliefs and practices of the community which can sometimes act as a barrier towards choosing a mode of infant feeding that is the most beneficial for the mother and child for their situation of living.

For example, mixed feeding is very commonly practiced in SSA in which regular foods and other liquids are introduced to the infants before it is an appropriate time to start weaning along with either breast milk or infant formula. Mothers are pressured from older family members and friends to follow this traditional norm. In places where communal living, respecting elders, and abiding to tradition is key to survival, young mothers face pressures between staying in good graces with the greater part of society and doing what is best for the wellbeing of the infant and herself. This unfortunately, can cause digestive complications and weaken the child’s immune system, which can increase the risk of transmission for HIV exposed infants.

Understanding and then optimizing upon factors that influence women to commit to feeding their infant as safely and feasibly as they possibly can despite social pressures can severely impact the effectiveness of policy recommendations and interventions by first catering to the context that these vulnerable populations are living in.
Objectives/Focus of Review:
The objective of this review is to understand the positive determinants that influence adoption of recommended early infant feeding practices such as exclusive breastfeeding and formula feeding among HIV + mothers in SSA and adherence to ARVS when made available.

METHODS:
Rationale for using realist synthesis:
The realist research question answers the question “What works for whom under what circumstances, how, and why”\textsuperscript{12}. Realist inquiry is based on a realist philosophy of science and considers the interaction between context, mechanism, and outcome. These types of syntheses address social realities that cannot be measured directly, but can be known indirectly\textsuperscript{12}. This idea can relay back to the very present social barriers HIV + mothers in SSA face when having to decide how to best feed their infants. Even though, these obstacles are not strongly addressed in policy, they can still be identified through the stories women tell through observational and qualitative studies.

Also, these syntheses can evaluate social programs, such as the PMTCT programs that implement WHO guideline policies into their interventions. These types of programs can benefit from the findings of realist reviews by presenting their information, resources, and opportunities in a way that best matches an individual’s social context so that the individual is better equipped to handle whatever barriers there may be\textsuperscript{12}.

Finally, to understand the relationship between context and outcome, realist reviews use the concept of mechanisms, or social structures which operate in particular contexts to generate outcomes of interest\textsuperscript{12}.

In the context of early infant feeding and an HIV + status, it is hoped that mothers in SSA who have information on recommendations from the 2010 WHO Guidelines on early infant feeding and access to ARVS or infant formula will adopt the optimum feeding method for their infant. If the knowledge of the guidelines can then be translated into concrete action or changes in attitude (mechanisms), in theory, one would expect to see ideal infant health outcomes. However, in reality, there are many other factors that a mother considers when deciding the safest infant feeding mode for her infant based on her situation, regardless of having or not having knowledge or other resources. Chart 1 of the appendix demonstrates what outcomes are to be expected based on knowledge (context) and utilization of resources (mechanism). This review is not only aimed to test out this theory but to then understand what determinants are most effective in relation to adherence of the WHO guideline recommendations in SSA in hopes that these findings can then be optimized and translated into policy that may reach vulnerable populations in other parts of the world. Conclusions drawn from this review can hopefully influence future WHO guidelines to consider cultural factors when giving out recommendations on infant feeding in the context of HIV.

A realist approach was chosen in order to understand how PMTCT programs and the WHO Guidelines can generate outcomes through HIV+ mothers deciding which infant feeding
practices fits their particular lifestyle and how causal mechanisms are shaped and constrained by social context.

Scope of the literature:
A review of the 2010 WHO Guidelines was first conducted in order to get a scope of what the infant feeding recommendations were for HIV + women are in different contexts. The guidelines were then used to build a Context-Mechanism-Outcome (CMO) model framework that would theoretically predict ideal mechanisms and outcomes based on those different contexts.

Search Process:
The literature search was iterative and ongoing throughout the project. An initial search was conducted of various academic databases such as Ovid Medline, Embase, and Global Health. Search terms included: Breastfeeding, Bottle Feeding, Infant Formula, HIV/HIV infections, and Africa/Africa South of the Sahara. Searches were also limited to articles written and English and published within the past five years. Iterative searches were carried out at a later time to find additional articles. As the review progressed, it became apparent that my initial search was not capturing the second aspect of my desired outcomes (determinants) or articles related to antiretroviral adherence while breastfeeding. Additional terms included this time around were Sociological Factors/Age Factors/Risk Factors/Sex Factors, Antiretroviral Therapy, and Highly Active/Anti-HIV Agents/antiretroviral agents that were added to the initial search terms. Three different searches were conducted based on infant feeding type. For example, for exclusive breastfeeding the following terms were used in various combinations: Breastfeeding, HIV/HIV infections, Africa/Africa South of the Sahara and Sociological Factors/Age Factors/Risk Factors/Sex Factors. For exclusive formula feeding, the terms bottle feeding and infant formula replaced breastfeeding. For adhering to ARVS during breastfeeding, the terms Antiretroviral Therapy, and Highly Active/Anti-HIV Agents/antiretroviral agents were added to the exclusive breastfeeding search.

Selection and Appraisal of Documents:
Titles and abstracts were analyzed to ascertain if they met the following criteria:
1. Studies conducted in SSA
2. Study populations including HIV+ mothers with infants
3. Study designs that are either of mixed methods or qualitative
   a. The realist approach offers the potential for insight that go beyond the narrowly experimental paradigm of the randomized control trial which is why they were excluded. Findings from this review are to reflect practical changes that can be made in an individual’s everyday life; not in a temporary controlled environment.
4. Outcomes include determinants of infant feeding types
5. Infant feeding types include: Exclusive breastfeed, Breastfeeding while using ARVs, and Exclusive Formula Feeding
Data extraction:
Demographical information about the study population and details related to how the study was conducted were collected. In addition, determinants of why these feeding types were chosen were also collected. Based on these outcomes, general themes were created based on similar findings among the included articles.

RESULTS:

Document of flow diagram:
Figure 2 in the appendix shows a flow diagram illustrating search process and article disposition. 171 of the articles from the initial search were then further screened to analyze full text references that brought the final count of my initial search to 19 articles. Commentary pieces were also included as contextual supportive information. 460 articles were collected from the iterative searches. The majority of the articles were able to be discarded as they many of them turned out to be duplicate articles that had been discarded previously from the initial search. Two additional articles were added at the completion of the iterative searches. A total of 21 articles were left for further analysis.

Document of characteristics: Demographic and Methodological characteristics for the inclusive studies are organized via Tables 1 and 2 of the appendix.

This review encompasses 22 articles with a study population of around 1500 HIV+ mothers total from 10 countries in SSA: Burkina Faso, Ethiopia, Ivory Coast, Nigeria, Zambia, Tanzania, South Africa, Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC), Malawi, and Uganda. The majority of the studies were conducted in South Africa (n=7). Ages of these mothers ranged from 15-40 years of age. Studies were conducted between 2002 and 2013. Study designs were a mix of qualitative and mixed methods with the majority of the studies as qualitative (n=17). Thirteen of the studies observed PMTCT counseling services being offered to the study participants.

Main Findings: Determinants of infant feeding practices by infant feeding type are described in Tables 3, 4, and 5 in the appendix and below.

ANTIRETROVIRAL THERAPY WHILE BREASTFEEDING:

Key determinants of using ARTs while breastfeeding included: self-efficacy, desire to avoid MTCT, having a good relationship with PMTCT counselors, disclosing status to family members and being able to gain their support, being able to prolong life, and the PMTCT programs providing free treatment

Self-Efficacy:

A woman's ability to adhere to medication amongst stigmatization was influenced by wanting to keep herself and her infant as healthy as possible. Having a strong and independent mind set to do what's right in the midst of objectification played as a strong factor into taking prescribed medications at the appropriate times and returning for refills.
One woman explained her commitment to adhere to the medication regimen in the Buesseler et al 2014 article: “I took the medicine in the morning at eight o’clock and also in the evening at eight o’clock. I never forget, because I am ill. I always ask someone with a watch if it is eight o’clock. My day to die has not yet come. I want to live a long life to care for my children”

According to Madiba, S. et al., 2013, most women experienced PMTCT positively, and the desire to protect their babies from HIV infection influenced their participation. A quote reads, “When I was taking treatment, I was thinking about the safety of the baby and also my wellbeing”

**Fear of Transmission:**

According to Buesseler, H. M. et al., 2014, women are strongly motivated to adhere to prophylaxis to protect their unborn baby. As one woman explained, “I was scared the baby would become HIV-positive, so I did every- thing [the midwives] told me to do”

**Good relationship with PMTCT counselors:**

According to Buesseler, H. M. et al., 2014, women trusted the advice of the midwives, who offer posttest encouragement and assistance, and assure the women that medications exist to prevent transmission to their babies. One quote reads, “Really, the only thing you need to do [to give birth to a healthy baby] is to follow the advice of the midwives”

**Disclosure of status/Support from Partners:**

According to Madiba, S. et al., 2013, those who disclosed to family members did so for the purpose of receiving support to adhere to PMTCT. A quote reads, “Only three people know my HIV status, which is my two aunts because when I started with ART one of them was my treatment buddy so that she can support me with taking of treatment”

**Prolong life:**

According to Ngarina, M. et al., 2014, some of the participants were very positive towards the idea of taking drugs for life after being diagnosed with HIV during pregnancy. They all gave the same reason that this will help them have a better and longer life enabling them to raise their children for a much longer. One quote reads, “I will take medicine for life and I will adhere to all instructions they give and I will take them all the time to protect myself so that I live longer and take care my children time before they die”

**Program providing Free Medication:**

Women reported that without free medications, they are likely to struggle to adhere to prophylaxis. According to Buesseler, H. M. et al., 2014 “the midwives consoled me and told me the medicines were free, so I felt better after that”
EXCLUSIVE FORMULA FEEDING:

For exclusively formula feeding, common determinants include: fear of MTCT, disclosure of status to family and support, having a good relationship with PMTCT counselors, being independent/ having flexibility in everyday routine, being financially stable, and having self-efficacy.

Fear of Transmission to Infants:

According to Cames, C. et al., 2010, mothers did not want to take any risks of infecting the infant, defined as ‘the top priority’, the social risk was pushed to the background. One mother says, ‘As for me, I give the baby formula because if he didn’t get the disease during the pregnancy, he can only get it when he grows up [infection at adulthood]. It won’t be me, his mother, who will be responsible for his infection’\textsuperscript{15}.

Disclosure of status to family/support:

According to Cames, C. et al., 2010, the husband was an actor, even leader, in not only developing strategies to resist the family circle but also sometimes in managing infant feeding. One mother says, “I had no problem during formula feeding because before I gave birth, my husband and I had intended to give the baby formula”\textsuperscript{15}.

Good relationship with PMTCT counselors:

According to Madiba, S. et al., 2013, most women perceived the counseling they received as good and reported that it made it easy for them to deal with their HIV status. A quote reads, “I gave my baby only bottle-feeding; I was helped by the counseling that was provided to us”. One mother says, ‘As for me, I give the baby formula because if he didn’t get the disease during the pregnancy, he can only get it when he grows up [infection at adulthood]. It won’t be me, his mother, who will be responsible for his infection’\textsuperscript{13}.

Having independence/flexibility in everyday routine:

According to Leshabari, S. C. et al., 2007, the majority of the formula feeding mothers was living alone or in a nuclear family and was not under the daily control of their mothers-in-law\textsuperscript{16}.

Financial stability/Program providing Free Formula:

According to Zulliger, R. et al., 2013, women expressed concern about the end of provision of free formula. They felt that formula allowed them to provide the best care for their children and to save their money for other expenses\textsuperscript{17}.
Self-Efficacy:

According to Cames, C. et al., 2010, "self-confidence was reinforced by practicing a feeding method that had no transmission risk and was viewed as adequate to satisfy the infant’s nutritional needs". Their high level of self-efficacy allowed them to see the consequences of their choice not as problems but rather as new stages that they must learn to surmount. One mother tells, “...when talking about difficulties, I especially want to talk about the fatigue, but now it’s OK”.

EXCLUSIVE BREASTFEEDING:

For exclusively breast feeding, common determinants include: it was the cultural norm and role of the mother, having a good relationship with PMTCT counselors, belief in breast milk having nutritious benefits, making the choice antepartum, and having self-efficacy.

Cultural Norm/Role of Mother:

According to Traore, A. T. et al., 2009 for the women, breastfeeding illustrates the concrete dimensions of maternity and constitutes one of the means to assume their role as mother.

Good relationship with PMTCT counselors:

According to Cames, C. et al., 2010, breastfeeding mothers particularly valorized the knowledge they acquired about breastfeeding techniques and considered themselves ‘informed’ compared with other mothers in their situation. One mother says, ‘As for me I thought that you simply breastfed the baby; I didn't know there was a way to breastfeed. You have to make sure the breast has no wounds that can transmit the disease to the baby’.

Nutritious Benefits/Protecting Child from Infectious Diseases:

According to Maman, S. et al., 2012, a motivating factor for continuing exclusive breastfeeding was the belief that breast milk provided essential protein for the infant’s health. Women often mentioned the fact that breastfeeding was “natural” and to deny their child of breast milk was too difficult.

Choice made antepartum:

According to Lawani, L. O. et al., 2014, all the mothers who practiced EBF made an informed infant feeding choice antepartum. This was made jointly by the partners in 61.1% of cases, indicating some level of male involvement/participation in PMTCT interventions, which is the recommended standard of care, especially in enhancing adherence to infant feeding choice and other PMTCT interventions.
Self-Efficacy:

According to Ostergaard, L. R. et al., 2010, a key factor in successful EBF is a feeling of empowerment within the woman, which allows her to negotiate the conflicting expectations of her kin and to navigate society's expectations of how she should behave as a mother. Only women with determination and social power can overcome this conflict. One woman states, “Sometimes my relatives and my mother were forcing me to start giving the child some food or water but I told them that I will follow what I have been told at the hospital” 20.

DISCUSSION:

Summary of Findings:
Upon completion of this realist review determinants for early infant feeding choices decided upon by HIV + mothers in SSA were identified.

Women reported high levels of adherence to during pregnancy and following delivery. Women receiving care from health centers report they are able to adhere to prophylaxis regimens. While stigma around using HIV treatment will always serve as an obstacle, women showed commitment to doing all they could to protect their infants from MTCT. The availability of free ARVs is also critical. Without free medications, significant more women are likely to struggle to adhere to prophylaxis where relatively few barriers were otherwise reported. Studies also found that women who disclosed to husbands or steady cohabiting partners were supported to adhere to infant feeding, as well as the baby’s ART medication. Finally, they were simply of the opinion that they needed to prolong their lives so that they could care for their young ones.

FF mothers showed to be more financially stable than breastfeeding mothers. They succeeded without major problems in justifying the use of expensive infant food with family and neighbors. Although their socio-economic conditions were better suited to cope with social pressure and replacement-feeding difficulties, ultimately, mothers who maintained their choice of FF were those who showed high levels of self-efficacy in the difficult process of protecting their infant from HIV infection and facing adverse situations. Mothers and infants also benefited from a sustained and excellent support and a care package within the health clinics.

Breastfeeding is imbued with meaning beyond the purely nutritional aspects and the physical feeding of a baby. The meaning attached to the feeding methods is embedded in concepts and norms of breastfeeding, procreation and motherhood. The study findings strongly demonstrate the power of breastfeeding as a culturally anchored practice and as a moral commitment on the part of the mother. Therefore, the issue doesn’t necessarily lie in convincing these mothers to breastfeed, but to do it exclusively when access to infant formula and ARVs are not available.

The long-term benefits of any PMTC program in low-income countries depend on its capability to support women in practicing EBF.
The social pressures to mix feed or early wean from older relatives will always be there as it serves as a cultural tradition in many SSA countries. However, mothers are rather determined to do what's best for their babies if given the right amount of support. Effective PMTCT counseling is a required social capital to actually practice EBF.

Limitations:

Limitations of the studies were that women were recruited within the framework of a PMTCT trial rather than a ‘routine’ context. It is likely that women who did not wish to participate experienced even greater difficulties with their feeding choice than those who consented.

Also, since women were recruited through clinic support groups, their responses may be skewed toward positive experiences with the health care system and a stronger biomedical orientation.

Social desirability bias may have influenced some women’s responses to questions about adherence. It is possible women perceived the interviewer to be closely linked to clinic staff, thereby limiting their inclination to be critical of the care they received.

The sample sizes were small, and the accounts presented here do not reflect the experiences of all HIV-positive mothers. These women may be different from other women living with HIV as a high proportion had disclosed their HIV status and had a socio-economic situation that enabled many to purchase formula milk and to remain at home with their infants during the first few months of life.

In terms of the articles related to ARV medication adherence, the validity of self-reports is put into question, as the studies did not have the capacity to objectively examine women's reported prophylaxis adherence.

Finally, since mixed feeding is such a huge cultural norm in this part of the world, the biggest limitation was finding articles that demonstrated success rates of EBF for at least 6 months.

Comparison with existing literature:
A meta-synthesis entitled “Commonalities and differences in infant feeding attitudes and practices in the context of HIV in Sub-Saharan Africa” by Tuthill, E. et al., 2014 was found to have a similar approach as my realist review. The aim of the meta-synthesis was to identify overarching themes, commonalities, and differences in infant feeding choices among qualitative studies with HIV+ mothers in SSA. The study’s findings addressed the influences on EBF and EFF, the role of family and healthcare providers, and the identity as wife and mother in the context of infant feeding. While this study looked at overall experiences of HIV+ mothers in SSA, my realist synthesis differs to focus on findings of determinants that positively influence mothers to decide on the most appropriate infant feeding choice specific to their situation. My review also includes mixed methods studies rather than just qualitative studies. Finally, I also include experiences of women who adhere to ARV.
medication while breastfeeding as well to include another cohort of HIV+ women with other distinct set of experiences.

POLICY IMPLICATIONS:

Most potential barriers to ARV adherence were overcome by women’s motivation to protect their infant’s health couple with the availability of free ARVs. Strong ties to the public health care system and high quality antenatal care (ANC) and PMTCT services also facilitate adherence to prophylaxis. Due to these findings, more evidence-based research should be conducted on where having support from both health clinics and family members makes a difference in using ARVs in addition to just having access to them. Although the counseling sessions in the PMTCT program are focused on the woman, the raising of a child in the African context is family oriented which has significant implications for the PMTCT program. It is essential that the PMTCT program is refocused to include community-based interventions that would educate male partners, family members and the community about infant feeding in the context of HIV infection to further reduce stigma.

This kind of research can then influence policy change to also address the social and cultural struggles women face in taking ARVs so they can potentially overcome them rather than just recommending that they take it based on availability.

Formula feeding seemed to be acceptable and feasible for some women in particularly favorable circumstances, when formula was sustainably provided for free. The WHO Guidelines give extensive provisions already for formula feeding. However, despite AFASS conditions, studies are showing an increase in women choosing to introduce formula to their infants even at the expense of mixed feeding. PMTCT services need to either to provide free formula for the first six months of birth in addition to governments providing clean water systems to sustain appropriate preparedness of delivering formula to infants or both policy and PMTCT services need to place more emphasis on the consequences of mixed feeding and that formula should only be introduced if efforts are exclusive for the full six months. The health care workers play a key role in providing correct information on PMTCT and supporting women’s infant feeding choices to adhere to guidelines of exclusive infant feeding.

EBF counseling guidelines need to be developed through the strategy of better understanding of HIV-positive mothers’ infant feeding experience, which takes into account the complexity of their socio-cultural context.

Counseling services must therefore go to a greater extent to recognize the cultural implications of breastfeeding, and consider each woman’s life situation. For example, guidelines should have counselors encouraging expecting mothers to make the decision to EBF prior to delivery and to also transfer their decision to significant family members such as the husband and grandmother. This will hopefully ease social pressure or at the most
make mothers more confident in their informed choice as to stand up to those social pressures.

In many sub-Saharan societies, exclusive breastfeeding is considered by far the best feeding option for HIV positive mothers, but is challenged by low acceptability and feasibility. Strengthening and generalizing promotion of exclusive breastfeeding should be a major public-health priority both for the infant’s HIV-free survival and the mother’s welfare while providing health benefits to all infants. This review indicates that investing in better relationships among PMTCT counselors, HIV + mothers, and close family members is likely to help improving EBF rates in the context of HIV in SSA. Ways in which this can be achieved is to further support this already instilled notion that breastfeeding is one of the most natural and rewarding events to be shared among mother and child regardless of HIV status. Breast milk has nutritious benefits that cannot be found in formula milk and is protective against infant mortality whereas contracting HIV is not necessarily a guaranteed death sentence. EBF is the most feasible feeding option for mothers in SSA and other investments with money that may have been intended for formula feeding should be emphasized. Finally, mothers need support in making the choice antepartum as to be more self-efficacious in resisting from outside pressures to mix feed or wean early. Specific tools and activities on how to carry out these ideas should be provided to PMTCT programs through agencies such as the WHO and should be included in their future policy recommendations to illustrate a more comprehensive scenario of what a mother living with HIV in a low resource setting has to consider when choosing the most appropriate infant feeding choice for her infant.
REFERENCES

30. Doherty T, Chopra M, Nkonki L, Jackson D, Greiner T. Effect of the HIV epidemic on infant feeding in South Africa: "When they see me coming with the tins they laugh at me". Bull World Health Organ. 2006; 84:90-6.
38. Levy JM, Webb AL, Sellen DW. "On our own, we can't manage": experiences with infant feeding recommendations among Malawian mothers living with HIV. International Breastfeeding Journal. 2010; 5.
45. Ramara NS, Maputle MS, Lekhuleni ME. Infant feeding and HIV positive mothers in the Capricorn District of Limpopo province. Curationis. 2010; 33:5-16.

APPENDIX:

Chart 1. Context-Mechanism Outcome Model

Access to ARV Therapy

- YES
  - Breastfeeding + ARV therapy
    - YES: Access to Infant Formula (AFASS conditions)
    - NO: Reduced MTCT/ Maternal and Infant Mortality

- NO
  - Access to Infant Formula (AFASS conditions)
    - YES
      - YES (Exclusive Breastfeeding)
      - NO (Formula Feeding)
Chart 2. Flow diagram illustrating search process and article disposition

Initial Search
HIV/HIV Infections, SSA, infant feeding practices

759 citations from three electronic databases: MEDLINE, EMBASE, GLOBAL HEALTH

171 citations after first screen (title/abstract)

19 citations after second full text screen

Iterative Search
Factors, HIV/HIV infection, SSA, and ARV therapy OR infant formula/bottle feeding OR breastfeeding (3 separate searches)

460 citations from three electronic databases: MEDLINE, EMBASE, GLOBAL HEALTH

2 citations after single screen

Total= 21 citations contributing to review analysis

Total= 21 citations contributing to review analysis
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author and Year</th>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Sample Size</th>
<th>Age of participants</th>
<th>Dates of data collected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Buesseler, H. M. et al., 2014</td>
<td>Ivory Coast</td>
<td>24 HIV-positive women and five health care workers</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>Aug 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cames, C. et al., 2010</td>
<td>Burkina Faso</td>
<td>17 formula-feeding and 19 breastfeeding mothers</td>
<td>Mean age (FF)=29; Mean age (BF)=25.6</td>
<td>April–May 2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinkonde, J. R. et al., 2012</td>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>20 HIV-positive mothers</td>
<td>32.2 rural: 28.5</td>
<td>February 2008 and April 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chisenga, M. et al., 2011</td>
<td>Zambia</td>
<td>20 HIV infected mothers; 7-10 HIV uninfected mothers; 7-10 midwives</td>
<td>HIV -= 25.6; HIV += 28.3; HIV-U=26.1</td>
<td>2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doherty, T. et al., 2006</td>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>40 HIV infected mothers</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>February and June 2004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doherty, T. et al., 2006</td>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>27 women who had a positive HIV test result</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>May 2004 and January 2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kafulafula, U. K. et al., 2013</td>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>16 HIV-positive mothers and 11 women with unknown HIV status</td>
<td>27.7</td>
<td>16 April 2009 and 8 May 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Koricho, A. T. et al., 2010</td>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>Twenty two HIV positive infant feeding women; 10 healthcare professionals</td>
<td>22 to 39</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lawani, L. O. et al., 2014</td>
<td>Nigeria</td>
<td>Of the 556 parturient infected with HIV/AIDS, those who had difficulty adhering to their preference.</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>August 1, 2012–July 31, 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Sample Description</td>
<td>Sample Size</td>
<td>Study Period</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leshabari, S. C. et al., 2007</td>
<td>Tanzania</td>
<td>20 HIV-positive mothers</td>
<td>20-32</td>
<td>August 2003 and June 2004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madiba, S. et al., 2013</td>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>25 post natal HIV positive women</td>
<td>18-40</td>
<td>November 2010 and February 2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maman, S. et al., 2011</td>
<td>DRC</td>
<td>Forty in-depth interviews were conducted with HIV + women who were pregnant (16) or who had recently given birth (24)</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>July through December, 2006</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matovu, J. N. et al., 2014</td>
<td>Uganda</td>
<td>9 HIV+ pregnant women; 10 HIV + mothers; 10 family members of pregnant women; 2 key informants</td>
<td>At least 18</td>
<td>September-November 2011.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medina, Mukerem et al., 2012</td>
<td>Ethiopia</td>
<td>10 HIV positive mothers</td>
<td>29.1</td>
<td>January 1 to February 30, 2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ngarina, M. et al., 2014</td>
<td>Tanzania</td>
<td>27 women and 31 IDIs</td>
<td>22–37 years</td>
<td>July 2012 and June 2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ostergaard, L. R. et al., 2010</td>
<td>Malawi</td>
<td>21 HIV + mothers</td>
<td>18-40</td>
<td>December 2008 to January 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ramara, N. S. et al., 2010</td>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>10 HIV + mothers</td>
<td>17-36</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thairu, L. N. et al., 2005</td>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>22 HIV + mothers</td>
<td>27.5</td>
<td>June–August 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traore, A. T. et al., 2009</td>
<td>Ivory Coast</td>
<td>20 couples; 16 mothers who interviewed alone</td>
<td>Coupled Females: 23 to 30</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author and Year</td>
<td>Study Design</td>
<td>Data Collection</td>
<td>Data Analysis</td>
<td>PMTCT counseling: Postnatal Care</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zulliger, R. et al., 2013</td>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>203 were postpartum and 207 were pregnant</td>
<td>Pregnant: 28.6; post-partum: 30.0</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buesseler, H. M. et al., 2014</td>
<td>Exploratory, qualitative</td>
<td>Semi structured interviews</td>
<td>Atlas.ti 6.1</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cames, C. et al., 2010</td>
<td>Qualitative</td>
<td>Six FGDs were conducted, three with formula-feeding and three with breastfeeding mothers.</td>
<td>reading and rereading word- processed texts, computerized coding, synthesizing and grouping sections of text</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinkonde, J. R. et al., 2012</td>
<td>Qualitative</td>
<td>In depth Interviews; case studies</td>
<td>Content analysis to find themes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chisenga, M. et al., 2011</td>
<td>Mixed Methods</td>
<td>Interviews and FDGs</td>
<td>Thematic data analysis</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doherty, T. et al., 2006</td>
<td>Qualitative Interview study</td>
<td>Interviews; One Focus Group Discussion</td>
<td>Interpretative approach for key categories and recurring themes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doherty, T. et al., 2006</td>
<td>Longitudinal, Qualitative Interview Study</td>
<td>Open-ended interviews</td>
<td>Thematic content method</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2. Methodological Characteristics of the Qualitative Studies Included in the Realist Review
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Study Type</th>
<th>Data Collection</th>
<th>Analysis Method</th>
<th>Validated</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kafulafula, U. K. et al., 2013</td>
<td>Exploratory Qualitative</td>
<td>FGDs and in depth interviews</td>
<td>Thematic content analysis</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Koricho, A. T. et al., 2010</td>
<td>Qualitative Interpretive Study</td>
<td>Interviews</td>
<td>Qualitative triangulation methods; themes</td>
<td>Not Specified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lawani, L. O. et al., 2014</td>
<td>Mixed Methods</td>
<td>Focused individual and group interviews</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leshabari, S. C. et al., 2007</td>
<td>Exploratory Descriptive</td>
<td>Observation; Open ended In-depth Interviews</td>
<td>Thematic approach</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madiba, S. et al., 2013</td>
<td>Qualitative</td>
<td>FGDs</td>
<td>Thematic approach</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maman, S. et al., 2011</td>
<td>Qualitative study</td>
<td>In-depth Interviews</td>
<td>Themes</td>
<td>Not Specified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matovu, J. N. et al., 2014</td>
<td>Phenomenological Qualitative</td>
<td>FGDs and interviews</td>
<td>Descriptive, topical and analytical reflection</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medina, Mukerem et al., 2012</td>
<td>Mixed Methods</td>
<td>In-depth Interviews</td>
<td>Likert's scale to measure attitude towards EBF</td>
<td>Not Specified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ngarina, M. et al., 2014</td>
<td>Exploratory Qualitative</td>
<td>FGDs and in depth interviews</td>
<td>Thematic content analysis</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ostergaard, L. R. et al., 2010</td>
<td>Qualitative study</td>
<td>Observation; In-depth Interviews</td>
<td>Thematic approach</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ramara, N. S. et al., 2010</td>
<td>Phenomenological Qualitative</td>
<td>In-depth Interviews</td>
<td>Themes</td>
<td>Not Specified</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study</td>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>Data Collection Method</td>
<td>Reference Material</td>
<td>Analysis Method</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sibeko, L. et al., 2009</td>
<td>Qualitative</td>
<td>In-depth Interviews; observations</td>
<td>Pattons general interview guide (2002)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thairu, L. N. et al., 2005</td>
<td>Ethnographic, qualitative</td>
<td>Exploratory Interviewing; Ethnographic Interviews</td>
<td>Conversation Analysis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traore, A. T. et al., 2009</td>
<td>Qualitative</td>
<td>In depth Interviews</td>
<td>Word, Excel</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zulliger, R. et al., 2013</td>
<td>Mixed Methods</td>
<td>semi-structured, qualitative interviews</td>
<td>themes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 3. Determinants of ARV Adherence while Breastfeeding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Self-Efficacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buesseler, H. M. et al., 2014</td>
<td>“I want to live a long life to care for my children.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madiba, S. et al., 2013</td>
<td>“Thinking about the safety of the baby and also my wellbeing”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ngarina, M. et al., 2014</td>
<td>“An opportunity to breastfeed for as long as they wished and still protect the baby”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Disclosure of Status/Support</th>
<th>Protection from Transmission</th>
<th>Role of PMTCT counselors</th>
<th>Independence/Flexibility</th>
<th>Formula Availability</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cames, C. et al., 2010</td>
<td>“My husband gets up at night and prepares the milk and then he feeds the baby”</td>
<td>“The top priority is to give her the formula and nothing will happen to her”</td>
<td>“Discussing it together is a great remedy”</td>
<td>“… I especially want to talk about the fatigue, but now it’s OK”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chinkonde, J. R. et al., 2012</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doherty, T. et al., 2006</td>
<td>“...What made my child to feed on this tin is my health condition. That is what is most important.”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doherty, T. et al., 2006</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“At night, I make it and store it in a flask.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author(s)</td>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Quote</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Koricho, A. T. et al., 2010</td>
<td>“The nurse almost screamed at me saying ‘Why are you going to breastfeed your baby? Are you going to give your baby your disease?’”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leshabari, S. C. et al., 2007</td>
<td>“It is the only way to prevent transmitting the HIV infection to the baby.”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ramara, N. S. et al., 2010</td>
<td>“My parents helped me and bought a tin of formula for my child”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traore, A. T. et al., 2009</td>
<td>“...We had to encourage each other to get through it.”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zulliger, R. et al., 2013</td>
<td>“I didn’t trust breastfeeding while positive.” “The nurse was open enough to advise me that in whatever I’m doing I shouldn’t put myself in a situation that may compromise my baby’s health.” “...Formula allowed them to provide the best care for their children and to save their money for other expenses.”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 5. Determinants of Exclusive Breast Feeding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Self-Efficacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chisenga, M. et al., 2011</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doherty, T. et al., 2006</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kafaulafula, U. K. et al., 2013</td>
<td>By giving me advice, for example, health</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Source</td>
<td>Quote</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>workers say that eating cassava and soaked rice every morning helps the mother to have adequate milk in her breasts. I think I will try it.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lawani, L. O. et al., 2014</td>
<td>“All the mothers who practiced EBF made an informed infant feeding choice antepartum.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leshabari, S. C. et al., 2007</td>
<td>“All good mothers breastfeed their babies.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madiba, S. et al., 2013</td>
<td>“After having the baby I came to the clinic so that they could write me a letter that supports that my baby must be exclusively breastfed.” “PMTCT assisted me to know that it is also important to breastfeed your baby even if you are HIV positive.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author(s) and Year</td>
<td>Quote</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maman, S. et al., 2011</td>
<td>“..but he encouraged me to continue breastfeeding, to squeeze the breasts to discharge the milk”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matovu, J. N. et al., 2014</td>
<td>“Breast milk is high-quality nutrition and promotes infant growth”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ostergaard, L. R. et al., 2010</td>
<td>“…Empowerment within the woman, which allows her to negotiate the conflicting expectations of her kin and to navigate society’s expectations of how she should behave as a mother.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author and Year</td>
<td>Quote 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sibeko, L. et al., 2009</td>
<td>“I am not going to visit my family in the farm until my baby is 6 months, at that time the baby will be eating food.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traore, A. T. et al., 2009</td>
<td>“They gave us all the information and advice we needed.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thairu, L. N. et al., 2005</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>