Liturgy and Musical Inculturation in a Post-Apartheid South African Catholicism

Austin Chinagorom Okigbo

University of Colorado Boulder

Follow this and additional works at: https://elischolar.library.yale.edu/yjmr

Part of the African Languages and Societies Commons, Catholic Studies Commons, Liturgy and Worship Commons, Missions and World Christianity Commons, Other Arts and Humanities Commons, and the Other Languages, Societies, and Cultures Commons

Recommended Citation
DOI: https://doi.org/10.17132/2377-231X.1190

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by EliScholar – A Digital Platform for Scholarly Publishing at Yale. It has been accepted for inclusion in Yale Journal of Music & Religion by an authorized editor of EliScholar – A Digital Platform for Scholarly Publishing at Yale. For more information, please contact elischolar@yale.edu.
I have visited several churches in the greater Durban area of KwaZulu-Natal in South Africa since 2005 to experience and document the liturgies and music in Catholic and several mainstream Protestant churches. My experience of the liturgies and music performed in these churches, and my conversations with choir directors and ensemble members, revealed that there is a concerted effort to transform the religious experiences and music in ways that reflect African and Zulu worldviews, aesthetic ideals, and cultural sensibilities.

At Emmanuel Catholic Cathedral in Durban, where I conducted extensive research and where I ministered as visiting associate pastor between 2006 and 2007, this objective is particularly realized in the phenomenon called cultural mass. The cultural mass is a once-a-year, elaborate liturgical celebration that makes use of Zulu language, artifacts, and song and dance performed to the accompaniment of idlamu, a two-sided cylindrical drum made from animal hides (Fig. 1). Other notable material cultural elements include “indigenous attires” made from animal skin (Fig. 2), black skirts with elaborate beadworks (a modern replication of the isidwaba), traditional women’s headgear called isicholo (Figs. 1 and 3), and other indigenous communal ritual elements such as broiled meat and utshuala, a local brew made from corn or millet (Fig. 4). While I use the extensive documentation that I made in 2007 as a resource in this essay, there have been some slight variations in the execution of the liturgies that I observed between 2007 and 2013. The features described above, however, have seemingly remained constant.

Figure 1 (left): The idlamu played during an entrance procession. Figure 2 (right): Dancer acting as an impi (a traditional Zulu warrior) dressed in animal skin with Zulu short spear, club, and shield. Photos taken by author at Emmanuel Cathedral, Durban, August 5, 2007.
In this essay, I suggest that the cultural mass is informed by inculturation theology, which functions in South Africa as part of Black Theology, and which developed as an intellectual framework for liberation during the anti-apartheid struggles.\(^1\) As a liturgical function to which musical performance is integral, the cultural mass comprises the space in which Zulu Christians are reinventing their indigenous cultural forms, which were stifled in the mission churches under colonialism and apartheid. Thus, through the process of liturgical and musical inculturation, the Zulu Christians express their religious understanding as African people, as well as fulfill the aspiration to maintain their Christian heritage, while being sensitive to their various cultural contexts as Zulu.

**Toward a Theology of Inculturation**

Inculturation\(^2\) refers to the adaptation of Christian teachings and practices to local cultures, and how the cultures shape the evolution of Christian practices. Or, as Patrick Ryan puts it, it pertains to how Christianity “becomes embodied within the rich variety of cultures.”\(^3\) The term “inculturation” became the official replacement for “adaptation” in the fourth instruction for the right application of the Conciliar Constitution on the Liturgy issued by the Sacred Congregation for the Divine Worship and the Discipline of the Sacraments (CDW). “Adaptation” was the official word used by the Second Vatican Council (Vatican II) in *Sacrosanctum Concilium*, nos. 37–40, to explain the norms of cultural adaptation of the liturgy. In the fourth instruction on the right application of the conciliar document, the CDW construed “adaptation,” which is a part of missionary terminology, as having the potential to “lead one to think of modifications of a somewhat transitory and external nature.”\(^4\) Drawing upon John Paul II’s apostolic exhortation,\(^5\) the Congregation showed a preference for the term “inculturation,” conflating it with the theology of the incarnation, so that “by inculturation, the church makes the Gospel incarnate in different cultures and at the same time introduces peoples, together with their cultures, into her own community.”\(^6\) The incarnational definition that is given to

---

*Figure 3 (left): Women in traditional attire. Figure 4 (above): Broiled meat and utsuhula in the ukamba (ceramic pot) displayed at the communion steps of the sanctuary. Photos taken by author at Emmanuel Cathedral, Durban, August 5, 2007.*

---
the term suggests a bidirectional operation in the process of inculturation, so that the fruit of the incarnation of the gospel in a given culture in turn enriches the universal ecclesial community. Thus, as a theological praxis, inculturation theology holds that “the Good News [gospel] becomes part of the [local] culture when it is expressed and its fundamental truths are embodied in local categories of concepts, symbols, rituals and language,” which in turn enriches the diversity of the church as the Body of Christ with multiple parts.

Though the term is a neologism, scholars have recognized the practice of inculturation as going back to the nascent church in Jerusalem. It was, for instance, the incorporation of the Greco-Roman cultures into the church that facilitated the resolution of the conflicts between Jewish and gentile Christians, a conflict that nearly fragmented the church in the first century. In the fourth instruction for the right application of the Conciliar Constitution on the Liturgy, the CDW alluded to the decision of the apostolic assembly of Jerusalem as a watershed moment that inaugurated and thus upheld the importance of inculturation of the Christian faith by not demanding the uncircumcised converts to abandon their cultures entirely in order to embrace the Hebraic practice of circumcision.

Whereas the Second Vatican Council gave the most significant impetus to the push for liturgy and musical inculturation, earlier papal letters laid the groundwork for what would take shape in Vatican II. For instance, in 1903 newly elected Pope Pius X, in response to the growing influence of the liturgical movement and scholarship that began in the second quarter of the nineteenth century, which advocated for liturgical reforms, issued a motu proprio in which he acknowledged the relevant place that local musical cultures hold in the life of Christian communities.

But it must, at the same time, be universal in the sense that while every nation is permitted to admit into its ecclesiastical compositions those special forms which may be said to constitute its native music, still these forms must be subordinated in such a manner to the general characteristics of sacred music that nobody of any nation may receive an impression other than good on hearing them.

Following in the footsteps of his predecessor, Pius XII anticipated the changes that would be advocated in Vatican II in his 1955 apostolic exhortation Musicae Sacrae (MS) in the spirit of liturgical adaptation. Although the emphasis was on the active participation of the faithful in the sacred liturgy, an issue that was central to the liturgical movement that began in the nineteenth century and was addressed more explicitly in his earlier encyclical, the Holy Father acknowledged the importance of the use of vernacular in liturgical texts and songs. The use of the local language is certainly the starting point of making the faith relevant to the unique sentiments, sensibilities, and experiences of the faithful. Pius XII referenced “popular religious hymns . . . [which] are written in the language of the people . . . closely related to the mentality and temperament of individual national groups, [and which] differ considerably among themselves according to the character of different races and localities.” He provided guidelines on how to include such songs into the liturgy, namely that they must be in full conformity with the doctrine of the Catholic faith; use plain language and simple melody; and manifest religious dignity and seriousness.
Finally, he acknowledged that these locally rooted song styles “can help to make the faithful accompany the sacred services both mentally and vocally and to join their own piety to the prayers of the priest. This happens when these hymns are properly adapted to the individual parts of the Mass, as we rejoice to know is being done in many parts of the Catholic world.”

The documents cited so far merely laid the groundwork for what was to come. At Vatican II, the council fathers became more explicit in calling for liturgical and musical inculturation. On the liturgy, the council fathers spoke eloquently:

Even in the liturgy, the Church has no wish to impose a rigid uniformity in matters which do not implicate the faith or the good of the whole community; rather does she respect and foster the genius and talents of the various races and peoples. Anything in these peoples’ way of life which is not indissolubly bound up with superstition and error she studies with sympathy and, if possible, preserves intact. Sometimes in fact she admits such things into the liturgy itself, so long as they harmonize with its true and authentic spirit.

In the light of this, and in regard to music, the council fathers declared:

In certain parts of the world, especially mission lands, there are peoples who have their own musical traditions, and these play a great part in their religious and social life. For this reason, due importance is to be attached to their music, and a suitable place is to be given to it, not only in forming their attitude toward religion, but also in adapting worship to their native genius.

At the heart of the preceding ecclesiastical documents on inculturation is the theology of incarnation, which recognizes that every culture has the capacity to allow the Christian faith to be embodied within it, to nurture it, and to grow the seed of the gospel for the spiritual wellbeing of the faithful within both the local and the universal church. It is in the light of this understanding that Patrick Ryan proposed the five elements of inculturation, which envisage the ways and conditions that would make the practice locally and universally relevant. The five elements are as follows:

- Inculturation presupposes the universal presence of God in human cultures and their ways of life;
- all cultures possess the “seeds of Christianity”;
- there is no such thing as Christian culture; instead there may be a continuity between Christianity and a culture, which is never complete, thus demanding constant reevaluation;
- every instance of inculturation must have the potential to enrich the church globally;
- and finally, inculturation for practical purposes demands disengaging the “essence” or the essential core of Christianity from the vestiges of western culture that it has acquired over the centuries.

This last element hinges on the third, which states that there is nothing like Christian culture; rather there is the truth of the gospel, which is so universal that it has the capacity to be embodied within the rich variety of cultures.

Inculturation theology is particularly resonant in Africa, Asia, and South America where there is a common perception of the standard Christian dogmas as couched in hegemonic, Eurocentric worldviews. Scholars of
inculturation theology from these regions tend to posit radical challenge to perceived western cultural domination within the space of the mainstream churches. Hence, they call for theological transformation through “reformulation or re-expression of Christianity in terms of the receiving cultures,” whereby sets of theological elements are reinterpreted to correspond to indigenous elements. Under the perceived sense of cultural oppression within the space of “western-informed Christianity,” some exponents of inculturation theology—especially in southern Africa—rephrased it as a “strategy for liberation.”

In Africa, the practice of inculturation has been particularly strong in the areas of liturgy and music. Liturgical performance and song compositions in indigenous languages, along with the adaptation of indigenous instruments, began gaining ground with the liturgical movements more than a decade preceding the Second Vatican Council, and peaked during the four decades after the council. The role of the second generation of European missionaries, beginning after World War II, to this effect is notable. It followed the initiative to inseminate missionary activities with the knowledge of anthropology in and through which missionaries were encouraged to pursue mastery of local languages, religion, folklore, mythology, and worldview. It marked a shift in attitude toward indigenous cultures, which hitherto had been treated as primitive and evil by the first-generation European missionaries. In the Catholic Church, the missionaries benefited from the anthropological works of scholars such as Fr. Placide Tempels, Geoffrey Parrinder, and the American Catholic Anthropological Conference led by scholars such as John M. Cooper, Leopold Tibester, and Louis Luzbetak. In fact, the second generation of missionaries found room to experiment, especially in the area of music. Across southern Africa, missionaries, some of whom were musicologists or at least had a special interest in music, began collecting and studying the techniques and forms of local indigenous music for the purpose of developing indigenous church music.

Within South Africa, the new-found missionary initiative culminated in the establishment of the Lumko Missiological Institute by the Southern African Catholic Bishops Conference (SACBC) in 1952. Much later, in the 1970s, the music department was added for the purpose of studying the local music of the people under the leadership of David Dargie, who compiled several collections of indigenous church music and later experimented in the 1980s with introducing into the Catholic mass the marimba, the diatonic key type that was developed at the KwanoNgoma School in Bulawayo in Zimbabwe. Yet the efforts at the Lumko Institute and David Dargie’s work yielded few results in terms of robust indigenous church music. Dargie himself reported that Africans showed nonreadiness to embrace the use of local and indigenous musical forms and styles. He argued that the utter rejection of the drum and drumming, especially by the “educated elite,” constituted a stumbling block to African musical idioms and instruments gaining pride of place in the mainstream churches. Additionally, I suggest that the climate of apartheid politics contributed to inhibiting the cultural evolution of liturgical indigenization in the Catholic Church and the mainstream Protestant churches. Moreover, there is a difference between the work at the Lumko Institute and what I documented happening at Emmanuel
Cathedral in Durban. While the latter is led by the Zulu people who comprise the largest demographic in the cathedral congregation, what took place at the former was led by white European missionaries at a time and in an environment that were still plagued by trust deficit thanks to the historical circumstances of colonialism and apartheid.

During my research in Durban, I worked with the choir at the Martyrs of Uganda Catholic Church in Umlazi near Durban, where the music was still largely sets of hymns performed from the hymnals, and many of them to recognizable tunes from the Westminster Hymnal from England. The offertory processions were, however, accompanied by choruses (in Zulu, amakorasi), a song form that draws from biblical texts, sung to repetitive tunes and accompanied by hand clapping and dance steps derived from traditional wedding songs (ingoma yommshado). Wedding songs are usually performed in a counterclockwise ring dance. In the Christian context, this dance is done while facing the altar. When I asked why this dance music is not the predominant genre in the worship music, the choirmaster explained that this style of music only began to enter the Catholic Church in the 1980s. The missionaries had forbidden them for a long time, and the effect of that prohibition still lingers. Nevertheless, from the 1970s the Black Consciousness Movement led by Steve Biko, and its allied Black Theology,\textsuperscript{34} began to influence church doctrines and attitudes toward African music, resulting in slow but gradual changes in the bid to shake off the restrictive shackles of the colonial missionary style of proselytization. Today, musical performances that reflect indigenous Zulu cultural ideals are becoming standard practice in the local mission churches with growing African populations. Therefore, it is in the light of the outlined theology and socio-political history that I examine the cultural mass at Emmanuel Cathedral. I suggest that the mass is reflective of the new consciousness and efforts in making the Christian faith and Catholic liturgy local and “indigenous.”

### Cultural Revival

The cultural mass at Emmanuel Cathedral started around 2002 thanks to the initiative of the administrator of the cathedral, Fr. Stephen Tully, who served in that capacity for over a decade. According to Father Tully, his aim was “to provide the Zulu community in the Diocese, which was growing in number, to freely express their faith in a manner that reflects their own worldview and customs” (personal conversation, January 2013). According to him, this was in line with the spirit of the Second Vatican Council, and he hoped that ultimately the cultural mass at the cathedral would lead the Church in Durban and KwaZulu-Natal to assume a more local face. Father Tully’s initiative drew upon two convergent sources of influence. The first was Archbishop Denis Hurley (1915–2004), who was his local ordinary through most of his formation years.\textsuperscript{35} The second was his training at the St. John Vianney Seminary in Pretoria.

Archbishop Hurley was one of the fathers of the Second Vatican Council. He made a total of ten speeches and four written submissions during the proceedings, many of which touched on his South African experience and the nation’s political history. The language of the speeches and the written submissions resonated with those of the conciliar documents such as \textit{Gaudium et Spes}, in which the council fathers laid emphasis on missionary activities that take cognizance...
of the culture of peoples among whom missionaries work, and the constitutional document on the sacred liturgy, *Sacrosanctum Concilium*. Back home in the Archdiocese of Durban in South Africa, the archbishop began to implement the recommendations of the Second Vatican Council in the areas of liturgy and catechesis. The zeal he brought back from Rome forced him to consider the implications of apartheid in the religious life of the Zulu people among whom he worked. Revisiting the history of European missionary activities in Africa, and in Natal in particular, the archbishop interpreted as acts of injustice the western missionaries’ efforts to suppress all aspects of African cultures and worldviews, and to label them as heathenish. As a champion of the anti-apartheid struggle in Natal and South Africa, he construed the implementation of the liturgical and catechetical reform as “an integral part of the struggle for justice.”

Regarding his training at the St. John Vianney Seminary, Father Tully acknowledged that “radical” ideas circulated among seminarians beginning in the 1960s in light of the unfolding history of apartheid. Among the students were some who participated in conversations within the intellectual circle of Black Theology that was championed by scholars such as Albert Nolan, OP, Bongajalo Goba, and Gabriel Setiloane.

Denis Hurley’s efforts at liturgical reform were overshadowed by his constant clashes with the apartheid government and his preoccupation with efforts to undo the unjust conditions of apartheid. Similarly, the visions of some of the pioneers of Black Theology, such as Goba and Setiloane, were also overshadowed by the immediacy of the quest for political freedom. Their ideas were suspect in the eyes of state authorities and the white-dominated church hierarchy. Yet, the influence of minds such as Hurley and some of the major exponents of Black Theology endured through the 1980s and 1990s, when Father Tully was in training in Pretoria. By the 1990s, with the dismantling of apartheid, the chief proponents of Black Theology began to shift away from their preoccupation with the idea of the Confessing Church, which was used to repudiate the apartheid state, to calls for cultural revival in the new atmosphere of socio-political freedom. It was in the light of this new call for cultural revival that Father Tully introduced the cultural mass as a ritual space in which the Catholic eucharist is given Zulu interpretation in a performative way.

The cultural mass was presided over by Father Thami (a Zulu native), assisted by Father Tully (a white South African) and Deacon Nkosi (also Zulu). It is noteworthy that Father Tully, who is fluent in IsiZulu, chose to invite Father Thami to preside at the cultural mass because of his experience as a cultural insider and his renowned theological insight on issues related to the dialogue between faith and culture.

**The Cultural Mass as Ritual Transformation**

Emmanuel Cathedral is a Gothic-style church that does not reflect the culture of the Zulu (Figs. 5, 6, and 7, next page). However, to celebrate the cultural mass in a manner that reflects Zulu worldview and culture, the sacred ritual space was transformed by several means: through decorations with artifacts that speak to Zulu ritualistic culture; a dress code that articulates Zulu social and spiritual symbolisms; and sonic phenomena that express Zulu musical ideals and aesthetic preferences. Some of the most
significant Zulu cultural elements that I will comment on are the Izikhamba, utshuala, and broiled meat.

The ukhamba (pl. izikhamba) is a ceramic pot that holds water or the utshuala, which are both important to the communal ritual of purification, reconciliation, and communion. Axel-Ivar Berglund noted that water contained in the ukhamba is used by the Zulu in a ritual ceremony called isidlo senhlazeko (communion of purification), which is usually presided over by an elder. The ceremony is held to purify members of the family or community who may be troubled by anger, hatred, and jealousy, and to appease the wrath of the ancestors. The ritual’s highpoint is the feasting on the broiled goat meat and the drinking of the utshuala; the feasting is often accompanied by singing and dancing.

Zulu sense of community includes the ancestors (amadlozi—family members who live in the afterlife), the living (abantu), and the unborn (ongakazalwa). The relationship of abantu with amadlozi and the relationship among the living are particularly important to this discussion. The Zulu believe that the occasional ritual of feasting on animals is essential for sustained, harmonious cohabitation in the family and protective interaction between abantu and amadlozi. Occasionally, amadlozi request this ritual ceremony, which could be revealed by inflicting physical ailment on a member of the family, but which must be discerned by a sangoma (a traditional priest and seer). At other times, the living who want to express gratitude for the blessings they received from their ancestors may convoke the ritual. The ritual usually

---

Figure 5 (left): Exterior of Emmanuel Cathedral in Durban. Figure 6 (top right): Interior of Emmanuel Cathedral. Figure 7 (bottom right): Abbot and Smith three-manual pipe organ in Emmanuel Cathedral, installed in 1912. Photos courtesy of Emmanuel Cathedral archives.
begins with the killing of the goats in the ezamadlozi (a roundhouse), which is considered the abode of the amadlozi, and where the rite of purification often takes place. A portion of the meat is usually placed by the central pole that supports the roof of the roundhouse for the amadlozi, who according to Berglund\(^40\) share in the communion ritual by licking the meat. The communion ritual is used to foster harmony in the community, which includes the living and their ancestors, as well as to attract healing and other forms of spiritual and material blessings from the ancestors. The ritual of isidlo senhlazeko is therefore one in which the dynamic interaction between the realms of the physical and the spiritual— that is, humans and their ancestors—is enacted and negotiated, a ritual efficacy that corresponds to or at least compares with the Catholic teaching on the eucharistic celebration as the summit of sacramental communion of the Church of heaven and earth.\(^41\)

**Musical Transformation**

Music in the parts of the mass that lend themselves to musical performativity is framed around the dynamics of rituals in the Zulu royal court. The segments include the entrance, recession, and the mass ordinaries, particularly the Gloria and the Sanctus.

**Entrance and Recessional Music Performed as Royal Outing**

Among the Zulu, the beginning and closing of the harvest festival and the Nkosi womhlababa (royal reed ceremony) is usually marked by the procession of the king, which is accompanied by song and dance, wherein the king and his entourage of chiefs are preceded by some of the infantry regiment led by the induna (captain of the regiment), the amakosazana (the princesses) together with the virgins in the community, and amakosigazi (wives of the king). The beginning of the procession is signaled by the beating of the idlamu (a two-sided cylindrical drum).

At the cultural mass, the entrance procession is choreographed as the procession of the king in and out of the royal homestead for the festival celebration. Besides the altar servers, several others participate in the entrance procession: women dressed in the traditional attire worn by married women (for example, the isicholo), representing the amakosigazi; young women dressed as Zulu virgins; and the impi dressed in the traditional regalia of the Zulu infantry. The procession is led with a song, Masi siguqe senge Inkosi (which is about welcoming Jesus, who enters as a king), performed in call-and-response form, thus forming a round. The song itself is accompanied by the idlamu, which provides the beat to the ngoma dance performed all the way to and at the altar.

The use of the idlamu in the procession is particularly significant. During my research in South Africa, I encountered debates about the use of the idlamu and its appropriateness within sacred spaces such as the church.\(^42\) Although the drum may have spiritual connotations in traditional Zulu society, it is used to signal the coming-out of the king from the royal homestead. This is the context represented in the mass. The drum is also used to transmit signals to the infantry regiments about an impending war. Its extant musical use, however, is mainly to accompany and accentuate the rhythm of the foot-stomping and the high-kick ngoma dance. Although the idlamu is central to Zulu ngoma dance, deeper inquiry into its history and meaning
reveals that it was not originally a Zulu instrument. This is thanks to linguistic and organological shreds of evidence.\footnote{43} The instrument probably entered Zulu musical culture through encounters with the British from the earliest days of the British military encampment at the port of Durban, or possibly as late as the First World War.\footnote{44} Historical, linguistic, and some organological evidence suggests that although the instrument may have had foreign origin, its centrality in the most socially powerful ngoma dance and its place in the activities around Zulu royalty elevated it to a place of cultural prominence, making it the instrument of choice in the cultural mass.

**The Gloria as Ihubo leNkosi**

The Gloria in the Catholic liturgy is an acclamation, a sung praise to the greatness of God as the creator and ruler of the universe. The Gloria is performed as the *Ihubo leNkosi* (royal song). Among the Zulu, the Nkosi (King) is a representative of Nkosi Yapheszulu, that is, the King of Heaven, also known as Umveliqanji. At the cultural mass, Lunga who acted as the emcee introduced the priest as *alter Christi*, or representative of Christ, and the visible image of the kingship of Jesus, who reigns in the hearts of the faithful as members of the Kingdom of God.

There are parallels between the Gloria and the *Ihubo leNkosi* that explain why the former is performed as the latter in the mass. The *Ihubo leNkosi*, also known as *Ingoma Yenkosi*, is considered the Zulu national anthem. It is a song in honor of the Zulu king; it is usually performed at every festive occasion where the king is present, especially the harvest festival. It contains praises to the king; accounts of the king’s genealogy, ancestral history, and achievements; and references to the greatness of the nation. Hence, the royal *ihubo* is a sacred song. According to Jensen Krige,\footnote{45} it was believed to bring the rain, and is performed in antiphonal and call-and-response form. The antiphonal and call-and-response style makes it pliable to communal delivery, just like the Gloria in the mass, which is a collective and communal acclamation of God.

**Ukuvusa or Ukugiya**

During the Gloria and Sanctus, Father Thami and MandlaNkosi (the man who performed the role of *impi* in the mass) danced in front of the altar to the music, accompanied by some women who also added their ululations to the singing at intervals (Fig. 8, next page). During the dance, at the 2007 edition of the cultural mass, Father Thami took the *iwisa* (fighting club) from MandlaNkosi, and they both danced around in front of the altar.

In my conversation with MandlaNkosi, he explained that the dance “is similar to the *ukugiya* dance which the officiant at the traditional ritual of purification, reconciliation, and communion performs to impress God.” His explanation tallies with Axel-Ivar Berglund’s finding in his research on Zulu thought patterns and symbolism.\footnote{46} According to Berglund, the Zulu believe that enemies are present during the communion rituals, working to thwart their efficacy. Hence, the officiant’s warlike dance is itself a fight against an imaginary enemy. However, it is also a dance meant to arouse the amadlozi and to impress them as a way to curry their favor and blessing. According to one of Berglund’s informants,

> It is like a soldier who does this in front of other soldiers when they are to fight. He is arousing them to do the thing...
they must do with vigour (ngamandla). That is what the man is doing when he dances. He is arousing the shades [ancestors] to do their work with vigour. He is waking them in that place where they are. That is the reason for the beating of the earth with the feet (that is the frequent dramatic stamping of the ground by the dancer). 47

In the light of the above, and in light of MandlaNkosi’s explanation, his soldierlike dressing and performance at the Introit, the Sanctus, and in front of the cathedral at the recession was to “impress God that He may bless the people (the worshippers).” It is interesting to note that scholars of indigenous Zulu thought and culture (including Berglund) believe that this ritual dance has fallen out of use in the context of the communal ritual of killing of animals. Yet, the practice is being kept alive in the cultural mass, where it is used to give Zulu meaning to the celebration of the eucharist as a communion.

The nature of music and dance that is deployed in the liturgy may be a source of curiosity for anyone familiar with the contemplative nature and decorum that characterizes the Roman Catholic liturgy. One may for instance wonder if the music, especially the exuberant display of dance particularly around the altar, may withstand scrutiny in light of Pius XII’s injunction that in adopting local musical cultures into the liturgy, it must be ensured that “[they] manifest religious dignity and seriousness.” 48 Or, still in light of his predecessor Pius X’s injunction in his motu proprio that “while every nation is permitted to admit into its ecclesiastical compositions those special forms which may be said to constitute its native music, still these forms must be subordinated in such a manner to the general characteristics of sacred music that nobody of any nation may receive an impression other than good on hearing them.” 49 I did in fact hear subtle criticism.

Figure 8: The presiding priest and the impi performing the ukuginya dance in front of the altar during the Gloria and Sanctus, accompanied by women participants. Durban, 2007. Photo by author.
from both the white and coloured members of the Cathedral parish, who thought that some aspects of the cultural mass are excessive, including aspects such as the use of the *idlamu* and the dance in front of the altar. In my conversations with Father Thami, he saw some reason in the criticism but cautioned against hasty judgment that could potentially mar the effort to make the people understand the Christian faith through a medium that makes sense to them. Father Steven Tully, on the other hand, argued that such criticism might be proceeding from a Eurocentric bias, which assumes that the cultural attitude of western people to religion and worship should constitute the yardstick for measuring what aspects of local culture are suitable for the liturgy. The same bias led to the prohibition of the local cultures in mission churches, which was deemed cultural imperialism, prompting the major exponents of Black Theology to construe inculturation as strategy for liberation, as stated earlier. Indeed, the explanation of Fathers Thami and Tully are arguably consistent with the Vatican II injunction that “the Church has no wish to impose a rigid uniformity in matters which do not implicate the faith or the good of the whole community; rather she does respect and foster the genius and talents of the various races and peoples.” Yet, while the cultural mass is still in its experimental stage, they agree that some of the sentiments deserve attention with the hope of developing a future practice that is local yet meaningful and responsive to the cultural sensibilities of the diverse culture groups that make up the Archdiocese of Durban, the Church in KwaZulu-Natal, and the South African nation, which has come to be known as a “rainbow nation.”

**Liturgical Attire at the Cultural Mass**

Despite its transformational impact, the conciliar constitution on the liturgy and the subsequent postconciliar document do not address liturgical attire. What has endured is what had existed for a long time, much of it going back to the fourth century, when the distinction between the clergy and secular fashion began to emerge, following the barbarian invasion of the Roman Empire. Yet, on the African continent, liturgical dress has been an important aspect of the conversation on inculturation as a way to foster local sensibilities. The conversation has not been limited to sacerdotal vestments. Rather, a movement focusing on uniforms for Catholic women, Christian fathers, and Catholic girls (for example, the Mary League Girls Association in southeastern Nigeria) has been ongoing. While little symbolic meaning has been attached to the lay faithful uniforms, in contrast to the traditional meanings associated with clerical vestments, discussion of the value of uniforms has mostly centered on distinguishing the various groups in the Church, according to the kind of pious devotion that individual groups choose to follow. For example, white dress for Catholic girls is a symbol of chastity (girls are encouraged to remain virgins until marriage), while the blue of their head tie is the color of the Blessed Virgin Mary, in whose footsteps they are encouraged to follow.

In South Africa, the elaborate use of uniforms within the ranks of the faithful is more common among members of the African Independent Churches (AIC) such as the Zionists and the Zulu Ibandla lamaNazaretha (Zulu Nazarite Church). The attire worn in these churches is
sometimes a hybrid of indigenous Nguni attire and western-derived attire. In fact, uniforms in the AIC predate the mainstream mission churches. It is arguable that the emergence of uniforms in the mission churches, including the Catholic Church, especially among the women’s guilds, was influenced by what started in the AIC groups. Up to now, however, no conversation has taken place on how to inculturate liturgical attire, apart from the occasional use of local fabrics as decoration on the stole and chasuble.

In light of the above, therefore, bearing in mind that the cultural mass at Emmanuel Cathedral is still experimental and a once-a-year event, the various attires worn during the celebration are equally experimental. From my conversations with Father Stephen Tully, other Zulu priests, and some lay faithful, the mass attires are adaptations of indigenous dresses that are part of the Royal Entourage during the Nkosi woMhlaba (as described in the section on royal outing above). Here, I would like to identify three categories of attire that are worn during the mass.

The first is the amakhosazana (princesses) and amantombazane (virgins). The seminudity involving bare-breasted young females in the Nkosi woMhlaba would have been an indecent appearance in the Church. Hence the young females who participated in the cultural mass instead wore kanga fabric cross-tied over their necks (Fig. 9).

The second category of attire is that worn by married women. The most prominent are the isidwaba (a black skirt with pleats, decorated with beads) and the isicholo (head gear) (see Figs. 1 and 3). The modern isidwaba, made from a black fabric, is modeled after the original version that would have been made from cowhide, died black, and sometimes beaded around the waist (Figs. 10 and 11, next page). Similar to the isidwaba, the isicholo (pl. izicholo), is a crown traditionally sewn from twigs or fiber and worn by married women. It should be noted that whereas the isicholo is traditionally married women’s attire, nowadays the hat is one of the prominent cultural symbols of the Zulu nation, and in fact of the entire South Africa; it is therefore ubiquitous in the tourist markets in South Africa.

None of the participants and interviewees could point to any ritual significance of the dress of the young maiden and the women other than that they mirror the Nkonsi woMhlaba and the ethnic/national cultural identity that they represent, especially the wearing of the isicholo. A third category of attire,
however—the male dancer who is dressed like a traditional Zulu warrior known as the *impi*—is symbolically significant in the ritual context. Among his outfits is the body armor made from cowhides and decorated with cow tails. His kilt is made of tails of a spotted wild cat in the genet family. Among his paraphernalia are the war implements, including the *iklwa* (stabbing spear), the *iwisa* (a fighting club, also known as *knobkerrie*), and the *umbumbuluza* (an approximately three-feet-long shield, a smaller version of the approximately five-feet-long *isihlangu*). As I stated above, drawing upon Berglund’s study, the Zulu believe that enemies are present during the communion rituals. The symbolism of the *impi* in the mass is premised on that understanding. The belief in the presence of contrary spiritual forces in ritual spaces working to thwart their efficacy is not unique to the Zulu.52 Many world religions teach that extra measures need to be taken to ensure the utmost efficacy of a ritual celebration, especially on the part of the participants. These include but may not be limited to performing pre-ritual acts of purification. In the Catholic tradition, one is purified by going to confession and doing penance as prescribed by the priest. Another measure is to invoke good spiritual agents to join and/or to assist in the ritual process. Again, in the Catholic liturgy we see this act of invocation in the closing words of the preface that ushers in the eucharistic rite proper: “[and] so, with the Angels and Archangels, with Thrones and Dominions, and with all the hosts and Powers of heaven, we sing the hymn of your glory.” The choir and congregation respond to these words in the acclamatory hymn *Sanctus, Sanctus, Sanctus*. It is in light of this understanding, therefore, and the seeming parallel in the *isidlo senhlazeko* (ritual of purification, reconciliation, and communion), that the *ukugiya* danced by the presiding priest and the *impi* must be appreciated. It is equally in that light that the *impi* dressed in the attire of the Zulu infantry soldier becomes symbolic.

On another level, the symbolic usage of indigenous attire in the cultural mass may be viewed through the lens of Victor Turner’s anthropological description of the human body as “the symbolic stage upon which the drama of socialization is enacted.”53 What people wear and how they

---

Figure 10 (right): The traditional *isidwaba*.

Figure 11 (below): women dressed in the modern version during the cultural mass in the cathedral on August 5, 2007. Photos by the author.
Adorn their bodies is imbued with aesthetic value. They also comprise a socialization process, namely that of self-enactment as a member or members of a specific cultural group. According to Hildi Hendrickson, it is the process “for constituting the social self, social organization, and shared notions of authority and value.” Attire is a field for representation with semiotic value and social import, which could be spiritual, economic, and/or political. It defines one person or group in differentiation from another, as an expression either of who they are or of who they do not want to be. Attire/clothing could participate in identity politics and the politics of resistance and/or representation. In the context of the cultural mass at Emmanuel Cathedral, the various modes of attire described in this essay are spiritually symbolic and express Zulu cultural identity.

Concluding Thought
The Catholic and Pauline teaching on “the communion of the saints” interprets the Church as the “mystical body of Christ” that consists of Jesus as the head of his Church, which is built upon the foundation of the apostles and prophets, and in which saints and sinners seek sanctification through the blood of Jesus as the sacrificial lamb. The ecclesiological teaching provides a theological point of entry for appreciating the rationale for using the ritual objects in the sacred space of the cathedral during the cultural mass. It is also useful for understanding the use of the traditional Zulu ritual of purification, reconciliation, and communion as a framework for the eucharistic celebration.

During his homily, Father Thami argued that the use of traditional Zulu objects must not be interpreted as a celebration of the indigenous Zulu rite of purification, reconciliation, and communion in the strict sense. Rather, the symbols help to focus the minds of participants on the liturgical action in a manner that “we can connect with as a people.” According to him, God who created human beings meets them where he put them, so “we can only make sense of the things we do in the Church, by starting from where God put us.” Father Thami took time to match specific moments of the mass with particular moments in the Zulu ceremony: the penitential rite (the Confiteor and Kyrie eleison) is comparable to the purification and reconciliation that is preceded by ukuvumisa (confession of anger); the liturgy of the word is comparable to the speech of the senior, which is usually performed as part of the isidlo senhlaze, and the rite of eucharist is comparable to the actual feasting on meat and drinking of the utshuala. At sacrifice of the mass, the eucharist is offered “to the praise and glory of His [God’s] name, for our good [the worshippers’], and the good of all His holy church.” Hence, the mass can be viewed as the communion of saints and the relationship of the faithful with God enacted in a performative way. Similarly, the Zulu rite of purification, reconciliation, and communion is a visible enactment of the relationship that exists in the community, which comprises the amadlozi and their living descendants who engage in the actual performance of the ritual.

The parallels so made notwithstanding, Father Thami believes that the mass must not be equated with the Zulu isidlo senhlaze. Instead, he insists that the parallel should “tell us that we Africans [Zulu], that our way is consistent with what the Church is doing and there is no reason why we should not do it according to our own cultural way.” In a personal conversation, he also said: “I
wanted our people to understand that the Church is not a white man's religion. The Church is our own too. The only thing is that we must worship God our own way as Zulu people, and let the white people worship their own way. We must not continue to tell them that doing it the African way is bad.” Similarly, Father Tully also maintained that the cultural mass is designed to provide the people with the opportunity to express themselves in the Church in a manner that reflects who they are as Zulu.

The works of eminent African Catholic theologians lend credence to Fathers Thami’s and Tully’s interpretations of the cultural mass. According to Vatican II, in the liturgy, “the faithful may express in their lives, and manifest to others, the mystery of Christ and the real nature of the true Church.” Hence, Eugene Elochukwu Uzukwu, one of the leading African voices on Inculturation Theology, drawing from the spirit of Vatican II, maintains that the Church is at its best in the liturgy, when people freely invest their mind and body at worship in “performing before God to delight him and for human sanctification as well.”55 Similarly, Paulinus Odozor opines that “the way contemporary African Catholics express their dependence on God in worship is currently shaped by some principal sources that include the traditional liturgies of the Catholic Church, and African traditional religious practices.”56

In conclusion, I would like to emphasize that the indigenous performances at the cultural mass must not be seen as mere spectacle. Rather, we must understand them as the actual manifestation of the people's spiritual disposition toward God as their creator in praise and adoration. Despite centuries of missionary efforts to suppress Zulu culture, and the fact that the apartheid may have delayed by some decades the opportunities provided by Vatican II to revive their culture and make them relevant to their local Christian experience, today Zulu Catholics are demonstrating their resilience in preserving their culture and forging a resurgent ethnic identity in the context of their Christian faith and life. They demonstrate, as Carol Muller has argued, that one may convert to biblical Christianity without losing one's cultural identity.57 By reviving and performing their Zulu identity by means of liturgical and musical inculturation in the Catholic space, Zulu Catholics are inscribing themselves in the story of the Catholic Church as the universal body wherein every individual and all peoples bring to the faith community their own unique attributes without the need to abandon their identity and take on the identity of another. God is a creator of beings in multiplicity, and each individual and group is unique before Him, while they are all united in Him.
Glossary of Zulu Words

abantu (people or persons; sing. umuntu)
amadlozi (ancestors; sing. idlozi)
amakorasi (Zulu/Nguni song form in antiphonal/call-and-response style)
amakosazana (princesses; sing. inkosazna)
amakosigazi (wives of the king/chief, sing. inkosigazi)
idlamu (two-headed cylindrical drum)
ihubo leNkosi (royal anthem or song, the king’s song; see also ingoma yeNkosi)
ikiwana (stabbing spear)
impi (Zulu infantry personnel)
ingoma yeNkosi (royal or king’s anthem; see also ihubo leNkosi)
ingoma yommshado (wedding song)
isangoma (diviner; pl. izangoma)
isicholo (head gear worn by married women)
isidlo senhlazeko (ritual of purification, reconciliation, and communion)
isidwaba (woman’s skirt made from cowhides)
iwisa (fighting club, also known as knobkerrie)
izikhamba (ceramic pots for water or local brew; sing. ukhamba)
ongoma (high-kick, foot-stomping dance)
Nkosi womhlaba (royal reed ceremony)
Nkosi Yaphezulu (King of Heaven; see also Umveliqanji)
ongakazalwa (the unborn)
ukhamba (see izikhamba)
ukuvumisa (confession of anger or bad feeling toward another)
ukwusa or ukugiyi (ritual dance to ward off imaginary enemies during the isidlo senhlazeko)
umbumbuluzo (an approximately three-feet-long shield carried by Zulu infantrymen)
Umveliqanji (same as Nkosi Yaphezulu)
utschuala (local brew made from corn or millet)

NOTES


2 Other terms such as “indigenization” (see D. S. Amalorpavadass, “Towards Indigenisation in the Liturgy,” Mission Theory for Our Times [1971]: 26–53) and “contextualization,” introduced into the ecclesiastical vocabulary by the World Council of Churches in 1972, have also been used as an alternative; see http://firmmanuel.blogspot.com/2011/07/liturgical-inculturation-adaptation.html (accessed June 23, 2015). Another term, “enculturation,” has also been used by some scholars; see, for example, Michael Galvan, “Enculturating the Liturgy in North America,” Liturgy 5/3 (1986): 40–45; and Matej Karásek, “Bharatiya Pooja: Worshipping Jesus Using Hindu Methods,” Nidan: International Journal for Indian Studies 4/1 (2019): 93–103. I must note, however, and I have argued about this as a misapplication of an anthropological concept that was first used by Herskovits in a 1948 publication; see Melville Herskovits, Man and His Works: The Science of Cultural Anthropology (New York: A. A. Knopf, 1948). As an anthropological concept, it refers to the process by which an individual acquires cultural knowledge and development of cultural competencies within a given culture through assimilating the principles and values of that culture. I therefore use “inculturation” (as opposed to enculturation) in this essay strictly as it has been developed and theologized in Catholic official documents and theological circles.
4 Congregation for Divine Worship (CDW) 1994, no. 4.
5 Redemptoris Missio (RM) 1990, no. 10.
6 See ibid.
7 Keteyi, Inculturation as a Strategy for Liberation, 37.
11 Tra le Sollecitudini (TLS) 1903, no. 2.
12 Musicae Sacrae (MS), nos. 62–64.
13 Mediator Dei (MD) 1947.
14 MS, no. 62.
15 MS, no. 63.
16 MS, no. 64.
17 Sacrosanctum Concilium (SC), no. 37.
18 SC, no. 119.
31 The institute closed the same year that it was established due to the withdrawal of support from the Pontifical Sacred Congregation for the Propagation of Faith (Propaganda Fide). Bishop Rosenthal of Queenstown reestablished it as the Missiological Research and Training Institute in Lady Frere in the
Cape Province in 1962, and it was finally moved to Germiston in Gauteng Province in 1985. For more on this history, see Prior Anselm, OFM, “A Brief History of the Lumko Institute” (master’s thesis, University of South Africa, 1993).

32 It was here that Dargie embarked on the collection project that resulted in his Collections of African Church Music in Sotho (1978), Xhosa (1978), Tswana (1978), and Zulu (1981), and An Introduction to Xhosa Zionist Church Music (no date).


35 Father Tully was ordained in 1994 but worked closely with the archbishop until his death in 2004.


37 Ibid., 178.

38 The concept of the Confessing Church is about the role of the church in standing up for truth and justice. This found practical explication at the Institute for Contextual Theology, from which the circle of pastors and theologians would eventually work on a process that led to the powerful Kairos Document in 1985, in which they unequivocally denounced apartheid as evil.


40 Ibid., 237.

41 See Catechism of the Catholic Church, nos. 946–59, 962.

42 For more on the issue of using the drum, see Okigbo, “Contesting Cultural Meaning.”

43 See ibid.


46 Berglund, Zulu Thought-Patterns and Symbolism, 235–37.

47 Ibid.

48 MS, no. 63.

49 TLS, no. 2.


51 For more on women’s attire in an AIC, see, for example, Carol Ann Muller, Rituals of Fertility and the Sacrifice of Desire: Nazarite Women’s Performance in South Africa (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999).

52 See, for instance, Michael Bakan, “Preventive Care for the Dead: Music, Community, and the Protection of Souls in Balinese Cremation Ceremony,” in The Oxford Handbook of Medical Ethnomusicology, ed. Benjamin D. Koen (Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), 246–64. Bakan explains that the funerary ritual accompanied by gamelan belanganjur music comprises a type of battle for the atma, the soul of the dead, to protect it from adversarial spirits who battle to upset the balance in the cosmic order, capture the atma, and thus prevent it from ascending to its rightful place above.


