2016

Music in the South African Anglican Diocese of Cape Town from 1900 to the Present: Toward a History of Anglican Music in the Anglican Church of Southern Africa

Andrew-John Bethke

College of the Transfiguration, Grahamstown, South Africa

Follow this and additional works at: <http://elischolar.library.yale.edu/yjmr>

Part of the [History of Christianity Commons](#), [Liturgy and Worship Commons](#), and the [Musicology Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Bethke, Andrew-John (2016) "Music in the South African Anglican Diocese of Cape Town from 1900 to the Present: Toward a History of Anglican Music in the Anglican Church of Southern Africa," *Yale Journal of Music & Religion*: Vol. 2: No. 1, Article 1. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.17132/2377-231X.1006>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by EliScholar – A Digital Platform for Scholarly Publishing at Yale. It has been accepted for inclusion in Yale Journal of Music & Religion by an authorized editor of EliScholar – A Digital Platform for Scholarly Publishing at Yale. For more information, please contact elischolar@yale.edu.

Music in the South African Anglican Diocese of Cape Town from 1900 to the Present:

Toward a History of Anglican Music in the Anglican Church of Southern Africa

Andrew-John Bethke

This article explores the roots of Anglican music in South Africa, focusing on the Diocese of Cape Town. It is a continuation of a survey that analyzed the historical trends in music from the early years of Anglicanism in the Cape Colony to the end of the nineteenth century (1790s–1900).¹ The present essay addresses musical developments and trends during the twentieth and early twenty-first centuries. It explores music in parish churches and at St. George's Cathedral, as well as attempting to gauge the place of music within the ever-widening ambit of South African Anglican consciousness.

The Diocese of Cape Town, once one of the largest Anglican dioceses in the world,² is now among the smallest in the Anglican Church of Southern Africa. It has subdivided several times and now encompasses only the greater city of Cape Town, an exclusively urban area. Sociologically, the region has a strong colonial residue, having been described as the most racially untransformed city in South Africa.³ Of the diocese's 47 parishes, only four can be described as traditionally black. They are situated in townships or "locations" on the fringes of the diocese and use Xhosa as their main language in worship. The other 43 parishes use English as their primary language. These "English" parishes generally derive their ethos from the British Anglican model (particularly in terms of worship trends and patterns). For example, very few parishes in the diocese have meaningfully engaged with the process of transforming their worship styles and liturgical languages, even if increasing numbers of people of color join their congregations.

The majority of black people living in Cape Town have their familial roots in the Eastern Cape Province, some 500 kilometers northeast of Cape Town. The history of Xhosa Anglican music is based there in mission stations like St. Matthew's (Keiskammahoek) and in towns like Grahamstown, where missionaries translated and wrote isiXhosa hymns and, in some cases, tried to find existing music suitable for use in Christian worship. This article does not deal with those aspects of Anglican musical history in detail, since they are connected with parishes and missions beyond the borders of the Diocese of Cape Town. The musical style inherent in the so-called black parishes mirrors the Eastern Cape tradition so closely that it can be described as being a direct export, untouched by musical idioms found elsewhere in the Diocese of Cape

¹ See Andrew-John Bethke, "The Roots of Anglican Music in Southern Africa: An Historic Survey of Anglican Music in the Cape," *Anglican and Episcopal History* 83.1 (March 2014): 1–19.

² At first it covered the entire modern geographical country of South Africa.

³ See "Cape Town 'too white, backward,'" <http://www.fin24.com/Business/Cape-Town-too-white-backward-20090122> (accessed Oct. 22, 2015).

Town. This style more adequately falls within the ambit of a study of Xhosa musical developments.

Sadly, despite 21 years of democracy in South Africa, the idea of choirs from different sides of the racial barrier working together is seldom mooted and hardly ever tried. Thus, the two traditions remain largely uninfluenced by each other. What follows, then, is largely a history of colonial parishes as they mirrored trends from abroad or tried new ideas that were inspired by local developments. Black music is addressed only briefly, particularly as it pertains to hymnody.

Anglican Music in the First Half of the Twentieth Century

The first 50 years of the twentieth century in South Africa were characterized by war and the foundations of formal apartheid. The two world wars had a devastating effect on the colonial nations that fought alongside their European overlords. The resulting damage to the South African economy meant that music was low on the list of priorities in schools and churches. More important, even before the Nationalist government began introducing apartheid in 1948, the British colonial authorities had supported, and in some cases encouraged, discrimination against indigenous black and coloured⁴ people.⁵ The Union of South Africa, created in 1910, benefited the white population in every way. There were concerted efforts to reconcile the English and Afrikaners, but other races were not included in this program.⁶ Perhaps most poignantly, the black South African soldiers who had fought for the freedom of Europe in the two world wars were denied it in their own land.

The Anglican Church of Southern Africa was part of this divisive racial system. In fact, its founding bishop, Robert Gray, unwittingly encouraged it. Until the middle of the twentieth century, the church had two separate administrations, one for whites, the other for mission converts.⁷ Besides the impact on the demographics of individual parishes, segregation also affected church societies and organizations. Cross-fertilization between African and European cultures was thus minimal until the 1980s. Consequently, the broader developments in black and white Anglican music have been independent.

There were unifying elements, however. Two that stand out are the liturgy and, surprisingly, *Hymns Ancient and Modern*. At the beginning of the century, the Book of Common Prayer 1662 was still the only authorized version in the Eastern Cape Province. Developments were slow, but by 1929 a new Eucharistic prayer was born and in 1954 a whole new prayer book was issued,

⁴ *Coloured* refers to people of mixed race. It is an accepted term of reference in South Africa, but not without contest in some academic quarters.

⁵ Herman Giliomee and Bernard Mbenga, *New History of South Africa* (Cape Town: Tafelberg, 2007), 186–88.

⁶ Giliomee and Mbenga, *New History of South Africa*, 229–37.

⁷ See “Provincial Missionary Conferences” in O. M. Suberg, *The Anglican Tradition in South Africa: A Historical Overview* (Pretoria: UNISA, 1999), 70–72. In the Cape, if the service included coloured people, they were required to sit at the back of the church, while the white parishioners sat at the front; see Mike Bamford, *Parish Profile: St John’s Church 175th Anniversary* (Cape Town: St John’s Wynberg, 2009), 3. Some churches had completely separate services for people of color, usually in the evening; see R. R. Langham-Carter, *Among the Vineyards: The Story of Christ Church, Constantia* (Cape Town: Christ Church Constantia, ca. 1985), 3. This resulted in the highly unusual evening Eucharists that were celebrated after Evening Prayer at Christ Church in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries; see Langham-Carter, *Among the Vineyards*, 26.

which in turn was translated into several local languages. Before the 1960s, the common round of services included Eucharist in the early morning, Matins at 11 a.m., and Evensong at 7 p.m. In many parishes the Offices were led by the choir and the congregation's participation was often fairly limited. In black parishes the people tended to be far more involved, singing much of the service themselves rather than relying on a choir.

Hymns Ancient and Modern (first published in 1861) infiltrated practically every Anglican parish in some way. It was virtually the only Anglican hymnal in southern Africa until the *English Hymnal* was published in 1906. It was used for every occasion in the church and was beloved by the people. Evidence suggests that many Anglicans owned their own hymn books, and there is no reason to believe that this changed until well into the twentieth century.⁸ Nowadays, many parishes supply hymn books in the pews, except in black parishes, where congregants are encouraged to own their own prayer book and hymnal.

Black mission hymnody was also influenced by *Hymns Ancient and Modern*, many missionaries choosing to translate the hymns they found in this publication. Sometimes the hymns were recorded and released as gramophone compilations with other “ethnic” Xhosa music.⁹

English worship was still dominated by the Authorized Version of the Bible (also known as the King James Bible). The vast selection of modern translations only began to emerge after the publication of the New English Bible in 1961.¹⁰ Thus, language usage continued to be formal and archaic through much of the twentieth century, with “thee” and “thou” characterizing any reference to God. Even hymn writers like R. T. Brooks (1918–85), C. A. Alington (1872–1955), and Jack Winslow (1882–1974) used archaic language.¹¹ Ironically, the Afrikaans, Xhosa, and Zulu translations of the Book of Common Prayer 1662 and its 1929 South African amendments, made in the early twentieth century, were far more contemporary linguistically because they were rendered in modern parlance.

Worship in the Anglican Church tended to be controlled by the clergy with very little, if any, input from laity. Since choirs were situated in the chancel and wore robes, they too were seen as leaders of the worship, which enhanced the status of choral singing greatly and proved helpful in recruiting members. In white parishes the widespread acceptance of Tractarian¹² theology throughout the diocese and province meant that worship tended to be fairly homogenous. Common worship books such as *Hymns Ancient and Modern*, the *Parish Psalter*, and the

⁸ Bethke, “The Roots of Anglican Music in Southern Africa,” 16.

⁹ Grant Olwage, “Apartheid’s Musical Signs: Reflections on Black Choralism, Modernity and Race-Ethnicity in the Segregation Era,” *Composing Apartheid: Music for and against Apartheid* (Johannesburg: WITS University Press, 2008), 37.

¹⁰ Ronald C. D. Jasper, *The Development of the Anglican Liturgy 1662–1980* (London: SPCK, 1989), 184.

¹¹ See *The New English Hymnal* 496, 265, and 240, respectively. South African hymn writers such as Patrick Terry, Owen Franklin, and Harry Wigget continued to write hymns using Elizabethan English well into the 1990s.

¹² Tractarian, or Anglo-Catholic, theology is the more Catholic side of Anglicanism (as opposed to the Evangelical and moderate Anglican theologies).

ubiquitous John Merbecke¹³ setting of the Eucharist meant that worship from parish to parish was almost identical. Even Evangelical parishes used these same resources.

Black parishes tended to be slightly different for two reasons. First, the liturgy was set in the vernacular. The translators were careful not to interfere with the liturgical progression or the inherently Western thought patterns, and so followed the Book of Common Prayer 1662 exactly.¹⁴ In this sense, the worship differed only in language, not in content. Second, the gradual improvements in the vernacular hymnals and the Africanization of the Western harmonic system ensured that the musical component of the services was unique.¹⁵ At the same time, an entire corpus of original black religious music, largely in Western idiom, began to emerge.¹⁶ Mission stations had introduced musical instruction to their converts during the nineteenth century.¹⁷ Consequently, black composers began writing hymns and anthems for their own choirs. The overtly Western teaching program of the early twentieth century¹⁸ and the subverted traditional culture of the black people meant that none of these compositions were truly “ethnic,”¹⁹ but they did display a predilection for certain chordal progressions which, to a certain extent, were not classically Victorian. Because of the segregated worship system, many of these compositions and hymn tunes remain unknown in traditionally white and coloured parishes.

Another major development in black Christianity in the early twentieth century was the Zionist movement. Anglicanism in South Africa has its own strand of this movement called “The Order of Ethiopia.” Zionist churches tend to encourage ethnic thought forms and music in worship.²⁰ As a result, drums and dancing began to rise in popularity in black church communities. Traditionally, urban black Anglicans tended to reject these trends, preferring to retain the Western formalities associated with Anglo-Catholic worship. Such trends were evident in Cape Town (and in the Eastern Cape), but the brunt of the Ethiopian movement was felt in the KwaZulu-Natal province.

¹³ John Merbecke (ca. 1510–ca. 1585) was a theologian and musician who created the *Book of Common Prayer Noted* (1550). It provided musical settings of the texts of the Book of Common Prayer 1549 with plainsong-like melodies.

¹⁴ Suberg, *The Anglican Tradition in South Africa*, 77.

¹⁵ David Dargie, “Christian Music Among Africans,” *Christianity in South Africa: A Political, Social and Cultural History*, ed. Richard Elphick and Rodney Davenport (Cape Town: David Philip, 1997), 320.

¹⁶ David B. Coplan, *In Township Tonight!: Three Centuries of South African Black City Music and Theatre*, 2nd ed. (Johannesburg: Jacana, 2007), 42–45.

¹⁷ See Coplan, *In Township Tonight!*, 39–42.

¹⁸ By the mid-twentieth century, Anglican missions were beginning to encourage local ethnic Xhosa music in their curricula. A report by inspector P. J. Britton in 1946 states, “Songs in Xosa [sic] (and other) languages, to the original African folk-tunes, are encouraged, especially in the lower standards of the schools, where the medium is the African tongue. Recent research in the Transkei and Ciskei has uncovered many beautiful tunes, which one hopes will be increasingly used in the schools.” See Kirby, letter to local government, 1946 (Cape Archives CO, vol. 4309, ref. CE 426).

¹⁹ See Olwage, “John Knox Bokwe, Colonial Composer,” *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 131/1: 6–13.

²⁰ Suberg, *The Anglican Tradition in South Africa*, 68–70.

Music at St. George's Cathedral in the First Half of the Twentieth Century

By the turn of the twentieth century, Thomas Barrow Dowling²¹ had been the incumbent organist of St. George's Cathedral in Cape Town for 12 years. In that time the choir had continued to flourish and attain significant musical heights. Dowling appears to have been a well-respected musician both in Cape Town and abroad, and his efforts in church music earned him a Lambeth doctorate.²² Perhaps his most important and longest-lasting contribution to music was his establishment of the Cape Organ Guild.²³ Throughout its history, this organization has supported local organists by hosting educational programs, concerts, and festivals.

Unlike English cathedrals, St. George's did not have the financial means to support a daily routine of choral services. But there was a precentor on the staff to supervise liturgy and music. The absence of daily services afforded the choir much time for rehearsal, and by the turn of the century the boy choristers were rehearsing every day. According to contemporary reports, the boys' voices were well trained and of high quality.²⁴ For an amateur choir, they seem to have achieved much distinction. Certainly, the choir was good enough to perform Bach's *St. Matthew Passion* and earn the praise of a visiting English musician.²⁵ Undoubtedly, they were the best Anglican choir in the diocese, and perhaps in the whole province. It is highly likely that city parishes looked up to the cathedral as the pinnacle of musical endeavor.

Some surviving music lists from the time show that the cathedral organists were following the British cathedral-style model closely, albeit with a slightly dated repertoire, since Stanford and contemporary composers do not feature regularly.²⁶ It appears that local compositions were not favored, unsuitable, or otherwise nonexistent, since there is no record of them.

The habit of appointing British musicians to premier church positions persisted into the early twentieth century. After Dowling retired, James Alban Hammer (1882–1952) was appointed organist.²⁷ Although he had been at Bloemfontein Cathedral since 1920, he was an expatriate with an FRCO²⁸ and much experience of the British Anglican choral scene.²⁹ Thus, the British flavor of Anglican music at St. George's continued.

Music in the Parish Churches in the First Half of the Twentieth Century

Developments in communication and sound recording in the first half of the twentieth century had a positive effect on music in parishes. New music was more easily available, except during the world wars, and musical education in schools, despite a lack of funding and resources,

²¹ Dr. Thomas Barrow Dowling was organist at St. George's Cathedral from 1888 to 1926.

²² A Lambeth doctorate can be an honorary degree in divinity, medicine, music, literature, or law, or a degree in theology by thesis. It is bestowed by the Archbishop of Canterbury.

²³ Barry Smith, "An Historical Survey of the Organs, Organists and Music of St George's Cathedral, Cape Town, from 1834–1952" (MA thesis, Rhodes University, 1968), 84–85.

²⁴ Smith, *An Historical Survey of Organs, Organists and Music at St George's Cathedral*, 90.

²⁵ Smith, *An Historical Survey of Organs, Organists and Music at St George's Cathedral*, 91.

²⁶ See Part 3 of Smith, *An Historical Survey of Organs, Organists and Music at St George's Cathedral*.

²⁷ Hammer served as organist from 1926 to 1952.

²⁸ FRCO (Fellow of the Royal College of Organists) is the highest qualification awarded by the college.

²⁹ Smith, *An Historical Survey of Organs, Organists and Music at St George's Cathedral*, 88–89.

ensured a succession of enthusiastic choristers. Matins and Evensong continued to be the main services on Sundays, supported by large congregations. In the late 1940s, the parish Eucharist movement began to influence South African clergy, and gradually parishes began introducing a 9:30 a.m. parish Eucharist as the principal morning service. Even then, Evensong remained as a popular evening alternative to the morning Eucharist.³⁰

In the smaller parishes, the canticles and psalms were probably sung to Anglican chant. Note, however, that metrical psalmody had largely died out with the appearance of *Hymns Ancient and Modern* in 1861. Herbert Howells, the English composer, commented on Anglican chanting at the parish church at Mossel Bay in 1921: “from the English Church, a chant for the Venite, sung too quickly to be unanimous”³¹ Whether the rapid style of chanting was common in other parishes is not known. Even today, some South African parishes chant all the words on the reciting tone as quickly as they can, slowing substantially for the termination. Understandably, the repertoire in these smaller churches was fairly limited and the role of the choir was mainly to lead congregational singing. Nonetheless, choirs prepared anthems for special occasions such as patronal feasts and other major festivals in the calendar. The *Parish Psalter* seems to have been fairly ubiquitous throughout the diocese and province at the parish level.³²

St. Matthew’s in Claremont (a small parish) may be representative of other similar-sized parishes. In 1902 they had a children’s singing group that led the congregation in the hymns.³³ On Epiphany Day they chanted a psalm and rendered a number of “Epiphany carols”³⁴ as anthems. The parish only acquired an organ in 1957, so they probably used a harmonium to accompany worship. Smaller parishes probably developed choirs with both men and women (rather than men and boys), since their resources were limited.

In larger parishes, choirs were more adventurous. Full settings of the canticles and anthems were regular features. The publication of the *Church Anthem Book* (edited by Henry Walford Davies and Henry Ley)³⁵ in 1933 must have enriched the repertoire of these groups. Wealthier parishes tended to attract good organists because of their choral traditions and fine instruments. Thus, churches like St. Saviour’s in Claremont, St. Paul’s in Rondebosch, and St. Michael and All Angels in Observatory continued to maintain choirs of men and boys. Their repertoire probably reflected the cathedral tradition. Other growing parishes had mixed choirs. Their repertoire was probably not quite as advanced. A photograph of the choir at Christ Church in

³⁰ Interviews with Christopher (Bergvliet, Cape Town, March 18, 2010) and Anthony Gregorowski (Pinelands, Cape Town, Nov. 22, 2009).

³¹ Heinrich van der Mescht, “Herbert Howells’ Visit to South Africa in 1921: His Views on Music and Musicians,” *South African Journal of Musicology (SAMUS)* 18 (1998): 53.

³² All interviewees mentioned this.

³³ L. R. Thomas, ed., *St Matthew’s Church Claremont: A Glimpse into the Past 100 Years* (Cape Town: St. Matthew’s Claremont, 1993), 4.

³⁴ These were probably the Epiphany hymns contained in *Hymns Ancient and Modern*, since neither the *English Hymnal* (1906) nor the *Oxford Book of Carols* (1928) had been published yet. If the first hymn of the dedication service is anything to go by, they were using the old edition of *Hymns Ancient and Modern* (Hymn 395 at the beginning of the dedication service is *O word of God above*, the first hymn in the section for “Festival of the Dedication of a Church”).

³⁵ Many South African parish music libraries have multiple copies of this anthology.

Kenilworth of 1913 or 1914 shows both male and female choristers.³⁶ In this photograph it is interesting that only the men are robed and the women are all dressed in white dresses with hats. At Christ Church in Kenilworth, the psalm chanting was rendered in the “King’s College fashion”³⁷ (a sign of the influence of gramophone recordings), and canticles and anthems featured regularly at Matins and Evensong. The Christ Church choir even participated in the Cape Town Eisteddfod from the 1920s to the 1940s, while Elsie Jennings was their organist and choir director.³⁸

Services of carols and lessons for Christmas began to rise in popularity during the first half of the twentieth century, a trend that can be directly attributed to the admiration for the Nine Lessons and Carols presented annually at King’s College in Cambridge since 1918. Anthony Gregorowski recalls that at All Saints in Plumstead, the carol service was presented during the Christmas season and not in Advent, as is common today.³⁹ Jean Westwood remembered that the choir of Christ Church in Kenilworth began rehearsing for the carol service in July each year.⁴⁰ For both choir and congregation, such services were the musical highlight of the year.

The liturgies with which we celebrate Easter these days⁴¹ were not a widespread feature of Anglican worship until the mid-1970s. Parishes willing to experiment liturgically eagerly tried out the Easter liturgies that emerged around 1950 in Roman Catholic circles, but by and large Anglican congregations were content with the South African version of the Book of Common Prayer. Some parishes presented works like Stainer’s *Crucifixion* to highlight the solemnity of the season.⁴²

In a few, though not all, parishes the music program was completely racially segregated,⁴³ with separate services, choirmasters, and organists.⁴⁴ Segregation increasingly became the norm as the Group Areas Act (1950) was introduced. As a consequence, church organizations were usually segregated too. For example, the Church Lads Brigade was almost entirely a coloured

³⁶ Ey Els, ed., *100 Years of God’s Grace: Christ Church Kenilworth* (Cape Town: Christ Church Kenilworth, 2007), 13. In the early twentieth century, Christ Church was a smaller parish, but it grew very quickly and soon boasted a fine musical tradition.

³⁷ Els, *100 Years of God’s Grace*, 48.

³⁸ Els, *100 Years of God’s Grace*, 49.

³⁹ Interview with Anthony Gregorowski (Pinelands, Cape Town, Nov. 22, 2009).

⁴⁰ Els, *100 Years of God’s Grace*, 49.

⁴¹ Today on Maundy Thursday there is a blessing of oils and renewal of priestly vows in the morning, and an evening Eucharist with foot washing, a commemoration of the institution of the Lord’s Supper, and the stripping of the altar. On Good Friday there is a liturgy of the day, including prayers for the world, veneration of the cross, and the Eucharist (usually consecrated the day before). Easter Day now includes the ceremonial lighting of the Easter candle, a vigil, and the reaffirmation of baptismal vows. Before the 1950s an evening Eucharist would have been unheard of. Usually, Maundy Thursday and Good Friday had Evensong services, and in some places a three-hour devotion was held from 12 to 3 P.M. on Friday. Easter Day was usually a celebratory Eucharist without the Easter candle, vigil, and baptismal vows.

⁴² Interview with Christopher Gregorowski (Bergvliet, Cape Town, March 18, 2010).

⁴³ Often a white congregation and a coloured congregation would worship at separate services in the same church building; see Langham-Carter, *Among the Vineyards*, 2–3.

⁴⁴ Langham-Carter, *Among the Vineyards*, 2–3.

group. They maintained lively marching bands that were extremely popular.⁴⁵ These bands also sought to instill Christian values and discipline in their members.⁴⁶ Many of the bands lasted well into the 1960s, but some have died out since then.

In summary, the first half of the twentieth century was a time of consolidation for the Anglican Church of Southern Africa. Parish choirs flourished and their repertoires broadened. The effects of the world wars were felt, but the resulting ecclesiastical reforms only began to emerge in South Africa in the 1960s. The colonial model was encouraged and fiercely guarded, although some modern trends in British church music were observable. For example, many parish choirs sang Anglican chant in the old style, rushing the words on the reciting note and slowing down significantly toward the cadence. The modern technique, advocated by British musicians, was to use the natural rhythm of the text to determine the overall rhythmic patterns of each verse. Very little local music for the church appears to have been composed by white Anglicans during the first 50 years of the twentieth century. However, in the newly established black parishes of Cape Town, black composers contributed new works for their choirs, mostly in Western style and usually composed in tonic sol-fa. Despite the growing African component of the church, Anglicanism in South Africa remained fundamentally British in character. The entire church hierarchy was composed of white male expatriates, and many of the priests were not locals. In the following 50 years, the racial mix of the church leadership would be transformed completely, particularly under the leadership of South Africa's first black archbishop, Desmond Tutu.

Developments since the Mid-1900s

The second half of the twentieth century witnessed tremendous changes in theology, worship, and music internationally. These changes resulted principally from the liturgical and charismatic movements and the growing secularization of the West after World War II. Southern African Anglicans had been at the forefront of liturgical revision in the early twentieth century, introducing a revolutionary Eucharistic prayer in 1929. But within a few decades even these changes proved inadequate for the next generation, which wanted contemporary language for prayer, especially after the New English Bible was published. The church heard the cry for renewal and, as part of an international liturgical renewal movement, began publishing experimental liturgies.

One consequence of the parish Eucharist movement and liturgical renewal is of particular importance. While the participation of the congregation during the Eucharist increased dramatically during in the latter half of the twentieth century, the role of the choir became decidedly uncertain. With the loss of the morning Office of Matins, the choir was no longer

⁴⁵ Langham-Carter mentions that both Christ Church in Constantia and St. Matthew's in Claremont had active marching bands. Beyond this, the Lads Brigade was a benevolent society that encouraged community values and the Christian faith. See Langham-Carter, *Among the Vineyards*, 27.

⁴⁶ See Sylvia Bruinders, "Soldiers of God: The Spectacular Musical Ministry of the Christmas Bands in the Western Cape, South Africa," *Brass Bands of the World: Militarism, Colonial Legacies, and Local Music Making*, ed. Suzel Ana Reily and Katherine Brucher (Farnham, Surrey: Ashgate, 2013), 140.

required to lead psalmody, the canticles, and the anthem. A participatory Eucharist left little space for choral leadership in a manner equivalent to the Offices. “Cathedral imitation” parishes had several options. One was to focus all of their energy on Evensong and allow the congregation to participate fully in the Eucharist. This occurred in a number of parishes such as St. Stephen’s in Pinelands and is still the practice in some churches today.⁴⁷ Another option was to ignore congregational participation altogether and introduce the great Mass settings of musical history into the newly revived shape of the liturgy (which included all of the traditional Ordinary sections of the Mass). In this option, the congregation’s musical participation was confined to hymn singing, which often happened in the staunch Anglo-Catholic parishes, such as St. Michael and All Angels in Observatory. A further option was to review the role of the choir and downgrade its ministry to leading congregational singing. Where this option was adopted, as at St. Andrew’s in Newlands, choirs gradually diminished and disappeared for want of musical challenges. Yet choirs in other congregations, such as Christ Church in Constantia, arrived at a compromise in which they participate in the congregational settings with great enthusiasm and contribute anthems and psalms occasionally. Four or five times a year they work toward special services of praise and thanksgiving where their participation is essential, such as in carol services, requiems for All Souls Day, and Easter cantatas.

However, by and large, the gradual disappearance of the devotional Offices of Matins and Evensong has required a massive shift in traditional South African Anglican music circles. The corpus of music designed exclusively for these services is gradually diminishing in significance. In fact, one of the uniquely Anglican contributions to liturgy and music in ecumenical Christianity, the Offices of sung Morning and Evening Prayer, are no longer held in high esteem in the Anglican Church at large. This decline has saddened many musicians who have doggedly tried to maintain the traditional ways. Yet it also signifies the diminishing British influence on the worldwide Anglican Communion. Perhaps this is a positive development for the Southern African Church, for it is no longer reliant on English culture to present “authentic” local worship.

The Royal School of Church Music

A number of individual South African parishes joined the Royal School of Church Music (RSCM) in the early 1930s,⁴⁸ but the benefits for local congregations must have been fairly limited. Claude Brown, the director of music at Diocesan College for Boys in the middle of the century, was appointed chief representative of the RSCM in South Africa in the late 1950s. He formed a small committee to organize national summer schools,⁴⁹ the first of which was held at St. Cyprian’s School for Girls (Cape Town) in 1960, and Gerald Knight, the British director of the RSCM, came to South Africa to lead it. The schools continued under the direction of local musicians⁵⁰ until 1967, when Knight returned. Since then the director has usually been a

⁴⁷ Interview with Margie Davidson and Christopher Guilmour (Pinelands, Cape Town, Jan. 22, 2010).

⁴⁸ J. F. Willet-Clarke, *RSCM Southern African Newsletter* 2 (July 1977). According to Barry Smith, St. George’s Cathedral joined the RSCM in 1933; see Smith, “The Royal School of Church Music in South Africa,” 156–58.

⁴⁹ Willet-Clarke, *RSCM Southern African Newsletter* 2.

⁵⁰ These included Claude Brown, Robert Selly, Barry Smith, and Shirley Gie.

distinguished English cathedral organist. At the 1967 summer school, Knight formed four branches of the RSCM in South Africa. The Northern Branch catered for the entire northern part of the country, mostly covering the old province of the Transvaal but also including Kimberley, while the Natal and Eastern Cape Branches served the eastern seaboard. The Cape Branch, based in Cape Town, has done most of its work in the immediate area of the city and surrounding towns, including Stellenbosch, but has seldom ventured as far as George and Knysna (which are technically under its jurisdiction).⁵¹

The Cape Branch has long been a vital force in Anglican music. Its minutes and correspondence reveal a society that concerned itself mainly with the presentation of day schools and workshops in traditional Anglican cathedral music. Often these day schools ended with a sung Evensong, using the Book of Common Prayer—South Africa (SAPB). Occasionally, training sessions for choir directors and choristers were presented. These courses usually focused on matters such as choral conducting, sight singing, and learning new repertoire.⁵² The branch enjoyed consistent growth until the late 1980s, mostly among Anglican parishes, but Methodist, Presbyterian, and Congregational churches occasionally showed interest.⁵³

The RSCM in Cape Town and across the country encouraged South African composers to write new settings of *Liturgy 1975* (L75) and *An Anglican Prayer Book 1989* (APB) as they were released. A number of small composition competitions ensured that a variety of local settings were introduced into the repertoire. Other competitions for hymn tunes and anthems were also organized.⁵⁴ The comments engendered by these competitions suggest that the standard of composition was fairly low.⁵⁵ The branches had not focused on courses for liturgical composition, which must surely be one of the RSCM's greatest failures, since running competitions does not automatically raise compositional standards. They did, however, commission some of South Africa's prominent composers to write music for the society. As a result, a number of purely South African publications have been released. Through the efforts of the Cape Branch, *A South African Collection*, published in 1988, contained a broad selection of musical items, including material from the Lumko Institute, *Nkosi Sikeleli*, and a host of locally composed anthems and hymn tunes.⁵⁶ The collection was used extensively at the 1989–90 Cape Town Summer School. The committee also commissioned the well-known South African composer Peter Klatzow to write an APB Eucharistic setting for use at the summer school. The setting, accessible as it is, has not been popular in parishes.

⁵¹ Malcolm Chalmers, "An Anglican Heritage in Transition: An Examination of the Role and Function of Traditional English Church Music in Four Anglican Parishes on the *Witwatersrand*" (MA thesis, WITS University, 2007), 95–96.

⁵² Interviews with Barry Smith and Owen Franklin (via email, March 9, 2010).

⁵³ In 1980 the membership included 40 Anglican parishes, three Congregational, one Catholic, one Methodist, and one Presbyterian. In addition, two choral societies and three schools were affiliated. See RSCM Cape AGM minutes 1981 (RSCM Archives).

⁵⁴ See Willet-Clarke, *RSCM Southern African Newsletter* 2; RSCM Cape Town Composition Competition Entries and RSCM Orange Free State and Northern Cape Branch Hymn Tune Competition Entry Form.

⁵⁵ *Report of Kimberly Sub-committee (March 1982–June 1983)*, July 1983.

⁵⁶ Errol Slater, organist at St. Paul's in Durban, reviewed this publication favorably in the February 1989 edition of *Seek*, the Anglican quarterly publication. In particular, he approved of the African songs and hymns in the collection (*Seek*, February 1989: 5 and 8).

In the 1980s, most of South Africa's RSCM committees began investigating how they could better serve the black Christian community. In the Cape Town region, Owen Franklin was particularly involved in teaching staff notation to black choirs.⁵⁷ The committee also hosted the *Missa Africana*, led by the Roman Catholic priest David Dargie. The Mass included Zimbabwean marimbas and local Xhosa instruments. Dargie was influential in helping to localize South African Roman Catholic worship in the 1970s and 1980s. He is an expert in Xhosa traditional music and conducted many workshops in the country to assist local people in composing their own music for the liturgy.⁵⁸

The RSCM in Cape Town had other roles. They made concerted efforts to introduce new hymns and Eucharistic settings to congregations in the diocese. However, it must be noted that they were not quite as quick to respond to the influx of scriptural songs (sometimes referred to as "choruses") into local worship. The minutes of the committee meetings fail to reflect much of a positive response concerning charismatic music until the mid-1990s, when the committee was chaired by Garmon Ashby.

At times, the committee has also seriously discussed the possibility of removing "Royal" from its name, as it appeared to be a reminder of colonialism.⁵⁹ It is true that the Church of England cathedral-style character of the society still remains, albeit to a lesser extent than in previous years. For example, while South African composers of church music are often featured in programs of the RSCM, almost no effort has been made to create new hybrid voices using southern African musical styles. Thus, the chances of hearing any choral music composed by black composers (usually in tonic sol-fa) or renditions of Ntsikana's⁶⁰ hymns at the RSCM are slim.

In the late 1990s the RSCM Cape Branch decided to look carefully at their situation and begin planning for the future. Margaret Fourie and Kathy Roberts facilitated a number of discussion groups and created a plan for future development.⁶¹ Similar planning sessions have been initiated by all the other RSCM branches, and a national administrative body was formed in the early 2000s to lead the organization. However, the local committees have retained an element of autonomy and control the organization of regional events. In March 2010 the national committee organized a brainstorming session to address the future of the RSCM in South Africa. Time will tell if all the decisions reached at that meeting will bear fruit. Certainly, there is a new

⁵⁷ RSCM Cape AGM minutes 1981 (RSCM Archives).

⁵⁸ RSCM Cape AGM minutes 1982 (RSCM Archives).

⁵⁹ Barry Smith, letter to Richard Cock dated Oct. 23, 1989 (RSCM Archives). Smith wrote: "I began to wonder that if our most important links with the RSCM are 'contacts and of providing people to run Summer Schools' (whom we in Cape Town find without the help of the RSCM anyway—in fact Lionel [Dakers] was positively unhelpful in 1985 when we invited Donald Hunt) and 'getting discounted music' (which choirs here can't afford anyway), then we should seriously investigate . . . [the] possibility [that] people see the word 'Royal' as redolent of the colonial, white supremacy Era."

⁶⁰ Ntsikana Gabi (d. 1821) was a Xhosa prophet from the Eastern Cape Province. He claimed not to have been converted by white missionaries (although he did have contact with at least one missionary before he became a prophet), but saw a vision and received hymns that proclaimed a fully inculturated version of Christianity.

⁶¹ See *RSCM (Cape) Plan for Future Developments* (RSCM Archives).

willingness on the part of the RSCM to become an ecumenical body that will cater for all church music needs. There is also a desire throughout the national church to improve musical standards.

Radio and Church Music

South Africa had a fledgling broadcasting industry from the early twentieth century. In 1927 the three separately administered divisions of broadcasting, all centered in South Africa's main cities (Cape Town, Johannesburg, and Durban), were amalgamated by I. W. Schlesinger to form the African Broadcasting Company.⁶² Even before that time, live music was an essential component of broadcasting, and one of Cape Town's eminent church musicians, Walter Swanson, was deeply involved in the performances. Although most of the music broadcast was chamber music or opera, occasionally larger oratorios were heard.⁶³ As a result of the flourishing local radio community, the BBC World Service, although available, was not quite as popular or influential. For example, week-day Evensong services were not routinely broadcast in South Africa, and thus British church music was not readily available on the airwaves.

The dearth of Anglican church music on radio did change in 1950, when Roger O'Hogan started his Sunday evening program *O Come Let Us Sing*. This legendary series continued for over 40 years and is still remembered fondly by many people. The program format was always the same, "with music chosen to reflect the season of the Church year in hymns, psalms, anthems and extracts from larger choral works."⁶⁴ The repertoire listeners were exposed to was fairly varied but by and large centered on the English choral canon performed by internationally known musicians.

Such illustrious church music exponents as the Temple Church Choir of London and King's College Chapel Choir of Cambridge feature regularly, along with fine organists like the late George Thalben-Ball and Simon Preston.

Massed choirs and great orchestras are also sometimes heard in the programme, with recordings made in ancient monasteries and abbeys—plain song, psalms, glorious old hymns and all manner of delights.⁶⁵

There is no doubt that this popular program influenced many an organist and choirmaster in the country and exposed listeners to the latest musical trends in English and European choral centers.

Consultations on Church Music in South Africa

In December 1967⁶⁶ and July 1969,⁶⁷ an ecumenical group of clergy and musicians met to discuss the role of music in the Southern African Church, with special reference to the black community. One of the most important topics at both consultations was localization. The Zionist

⁶² Marjorie Swanson, *Walter Swanson: A Biography* (Cape Town: Pretext, 1996), 9.

⁶³ See Swanson, *Walter Swanson* for a thorough account of the inner workings of the music department of Cape Town's broadcasting community.

⁶⁴ Jill Mills, "Roger O'Hogan—40 Years Filled with the Finest Music," *Vir die Musiekleier* 17 (December 1990): 60.

⁶⁵ Mills, "Roger O'Hogan," 60.

⁶⁶ See African Church Music: Report on the Consultation on African Church Music Held by the Christian Academy at Roodekrans (Roodekrans: Christian Academy, 1967).

⁶⁷ See *Consultation on African Church Music* (Roodekrans: Christian Academy, 1969).

churches had already introduced traditional African music in their worship early in the twentieth century, and African indigenization had begun to seep into jazz and popular township music in the 1930s.⁶⁸ But mainline churches were slow to realize the importance of this shift in musical consciousness among their members. To address the issue of indigenization, the speakers at the conferences introduced topics such as “theological aspects of indigenisation,” “the role of music and dancing in services of the independent churches,” “developing our own musical tradition,” “translation of hymns—possibilities and limitation,” and “African music and its significance for divine service.” The speakers were both black and white and represented a host of denominational affiliations. Blacks and whites showed a remarkable willingness to work together in establishing common bonds, a difficult task in apartheid South Africa.

These two conferences revealed the advanced ecumenical cooperation between churches that culminated in the Church Unity Commission⁶⁹—something quite unique in South Africa. Many of the musical problems faced by black congregations were similar: inadequate translations of Western hymnody, unsingable Western tunes, a dearth of local composers, problems with tonic sol-fa notation, and suspicion of ethnic music. Many Christian black clergy and musicians had been so Westernized that they were apprehensive about introducing their own traditional music in church settings. And yet, Zionist churches were growing at an incredible rate because they embraced African idioms.

The Anglican delegates at the conferences were all from northern South Africa and so could not speak on behalf of their counterparts in Cape Town. Yet, since so many of the delegates from diverse denominations and cultures shared similar problems, it is fair to assume that Xhosa Christians in the townships of Cape Town faced comparable obstacles. These were the delegates’ observations:

1. Black congregations preferred *Hymns Ancient and Modern* to the *English Hymnal* because the harmonies in the former book were simple and clear.
2. Tunes with freer rhythms were required.
3. Attempts had been made to introduce national songs.
4. Traditional hymns and liturgical music were being introduced.
5. Plainsong was found to be disliked in most communities (probably because they are mainly in modes that are foreign to African musical systems). As a result, the delegates felt it should be discarded.
6. Modern folk Masses, such as Geoffrey Beaumont’s, were found to be unsuitable because they required instrumental accompaniment, and the black Anglican delegates felt that this style would soon become dated.⁷⁰

At the 1969 consultation, three study documents were published for delegates. The first one is of particular interest. In it the lack of training for church musicians was lamented and a number of

⁶⁸ Christopher Ballentine, “Music and Emancipation,” *The World of South African Music: A Reader*, ed. Christine Lucia (Cambridge: Cambridge Scholars Press, 2005), 189.

⁶⁹ The Church Unity Commission was formed in the early 1990s. Officially the Anglican, Methodist, Presbyterian and Congregational Churches are in communion according to this commission.

⁷⁰ *African Church Music*, 10 (Cory Library).

solutions to this problem were suggested. It was felt that training for cantors, choirmasters, and composers was essential for a vital music tradition.⁷¹ Joseph Maphope, one of the speakers at the consultation, suggested that black composers begin researching South African folk music to gain inspiration for new compositions. He reminded the delegates that Bartók, Liszt, and Dvořák had incorporated folk song into their idiom of composition to inspire nationalism.⁷² Special training for clergy in liturgy, hymnology, and liturgical music was also envisaged.⁷³ One of the greatest problems identified was the lack of trained musicians to facilitate the recommendations of the study document. An Anglican participant noted, “Our church does not have sufficient well-trained men, sufficiently free from other duties, to be able to undertake intensive work in Church music.”⁷⁴ Fifty years on, most of these problems remain unresolved.

The Xhosa Hymn Book and Liberation Music

Traditionally, black congregations in the Diocese of Cape Town have used the Xhosa hymn book *Iculo Lase-Tshetshi Ne-Ngoma*, the only truly local Anglican hymn book in the diocese. Much of the textual material it contains was derived from *Hymns Ancient and Modern* (Standard Edition 1924), but some local hymns⁷⁵ and tunes⁷⁶ are also included. It was first published in 1916 and was slightly enlarged in 1975 to include local settings of *Liturgy 75*.⁷⁷ So much has happened to enrich Xhosa church music in the past 30 years, particularly in the Roman Catholic Church, that it seems a pity that Xhosa Anglicans have not updated their official hymnal to reflect these changes. This is not true for the whole province, however; Zulu Anglicans thoroughly revised their hymn book in 1995. Although they retained many traditional Western hymns and tunes, a new section with local choruses (*Amakhorasi*) was added.⁷⁸ In practice, much new Xhosa material (particularly local tunes) is sung by congregations, although this music is often transmitted orally.

During the 1980s, at the height of apartheid, music by black South Africans became a catalyst for liberation. Freedom songs began appearing at mass gatherings and even in church. Many of these songs, such as *Nkosi sikeleli*, had overtly Christian texts. Other church songs/anthems, although not freedom songs per se, promoted a sense of unity and nationalism among communities. As a result, music composed in the African style became a potent form of rebellion against the dominance of Western music. Moreover, freedom songs became a powerful

⁷¹ *Consultation on African Church Music*, 88 (Cory Library).

⁷² *Consultation on African Church Music*, 75 (Cory Library).

⁷³ *Consultation on African Church Music*, 88 (Cory Library).

⁷⁴ *Consultation on African Church Music*, 18 (Cory Library).

⁷⁵ Ntsikana's hymn was included. Other texts by South African clergy were included too: from Rev. J. M. Dwane, Rev. W. Gwensa, Rev. E. J. Manzana, Rev. V. C. Mayaba, Rev. W. W. Mjokozeli, J. Ntsiko, Rev. A. G. Nyovane, Rev. Tiyo Soga, and Rev. J. J. Xaba.

⁷⁶ The number of local tunes is far less representative. Christopher Birkett's *Ngoma* features significantly, with 14 tunes. Birkett was one of the tonic sol-fa pioneers of early South Africa. He worked extensively with the Xhosa in the Eastern Cape. Two tunes by John Knox Bokwe were included and one by Rev. C. Nyombolo.

⁷⁷ *Liturgy 1975* was an experimental liturgy that was used until 1989, when *An Anglican Prayer Book 1989* was promulgated.

⁷⁸ See *Amaculo Esheshi* (Johannesburg: HarperCollins, 1995).

form of anti-apartheid protest, something that the white government took very seriously. On June 19, 1986, during the second state of emergency, the whole congregation of St. Nicholas in Matroosfontein was arrested for singing freedom songs during their Sunday Eucharist.⁷⁹

After Vatican II, in the early 1960s, the Roman Catholic Church began encouraging liturgical and musical localization among their non-Western dioceses. More important, they also began promoting the Africanization of church leadership. The Anglican Church soon followed their example and by the late 1960s had elected their first black bishop, Alpheus Zulu. The growing consciousness of African identity began to filter into music making too. In the Roman Church, David Dargie made it his mission to work with the Xhosa people, helping them to incorporate their traditional musical forms into Christian worship.⁸⁰ This was no easy task. The Xhosa people had been so inculturated by the British in the early twentieth century that there were few proponents of pure Xhosa music. However, Hugh Tracey, the renowned ethnomusicologist, had made numerous recordings of traditional music, and with the help of these recordings and the local people, Dargie developed a group compositional technique. Over two decades he introduced his method across the country. In a matter of years a corpus of new Xhosa church songs was available through the Lumko Mission.⁸¹ Anglicans have adopted a number of these songs into their worship, especially the music to accompany the Eucharist. An example is the ever-popular *Masithi Amen*. Dargie also introduced the Zimbabwean marimba, which had been used with great success among the Zimbabwean church people. In black congregations today it is not unusual to find worship accompanied by marimbas, although they are not indigenous to South Africa.⁸² Interest in traditional music cultures in South Africa continues to grow.

Other Hymn Books

In the early months of 1975, the Anglican Church of Southern Africa's publishing house released *Sing Hosanna*, a bilingual (Afrikaans/English) hymn book. Although it may have been used as a unifying element for English and Afrikaner congregations, it never reached its full potential, probably because very little contemporary material was included. In a letter to *Seek* in April 1975, Barry Smith described the hymn book as "ultra conservative."⁸³ In particular, he lamented the lack of modern hymnody.

Thirty years later, the matter of a local English hymn book was raised at Provincial Synod. The proposer of the motion to compile the collection noted that, among other things, the theological shifts represented by *APB* were not adequately represented by *Hymns Ancient and*

⁷⁹ Bob Clarke, *Anglicans against Apartheid 1936–1996* (Pietermaritzburg: Cluster Publications, 2008), 401.

⁸⁰ For a detailed discussion of Dargie's work, see David Dargie, "African Church Music and Liberation" (Anglican Archives, AB 2546/R17).

⁸¹ David Dargie, "Lumko Music Department: Report on Activities Until October 1981," *South African Journal of Musicology* 2 (1982).

⁸² St. Mary's in Gugulethu owns a set of marimbas.

⁸³ *Seek*, April 1975: 12.

Modern or the English Hymnal.⁸⁴ For a start, these books contained no local material. The proposal also included an important recommendation that

[t]he Metropolitan be respectfully requested to establish a Standing Commission on church music, charged with providing authorised, effective, and moving music resources for the CPSA [sic] that both retain key theological features of the Christian faith and are also inclusive of the local languages and cultures of [southern Africa]; gender; age groups; [differing theological stances]; and [different musical styles].⁸⁵

The synod resolved that “the Metropolitan be respectfully requested to establish a Commission to begin the process of producing such a hymnal which reflects both the diversity of our Province and its rich musical traditions.”⁸⁶ However, neither of these commissions has yet been established.

The Charismatic Movement

In the 1970s, a charismatic revival swept through the worldwide church, affecting almost every denomination. As in many other movements in the church, a certain body of music began to emerge that supported charismatic teaching. For years some churches had been working to “emancipate the laity,” and this work was just beginning to bear fruit at about the same time as the charismatic movement was blooming. As a result, a number of inexperienced lay musicians were encouraged to begin leading parish music. The impact was vast. Much charismatic music was written and arranged by amateur and untrained musicians, and in many senses it was a genre of folk music. Many professionally trained musicians found the folk genre unsuitable for formal

⁸⁴ Resolution 8 (2005):

This Synod:

1. **Recognising that** 1.1 Musical resources are an extremely important factor in congregational life, and help to shape the spiritual life of the community of faith in Christ.
- 1.2 The APB 1989 represents a distinctive theological emphasis that is not satisfactorily reflected in our normal musical resources, which include *The English Hymnal*, *The Ancient and Modern Hymnal*, 100 Hymns for Today, or our several vernacular hymnals.
- 1.3 The wording or theology of some (though not all) of the above normal musical resources is no longer appropriate in the congregations whose membership contains or bridges varieties of the following factors: theological emphasis, genders, age groupings, cultural and intercultural groupings.
- 1.4 Several of our bishops have called for transformation in the individuals and assemblies of the Anglican Church.
- 1.5 Some congregations have felt constrained to adopt makeshift, unorthodox or even illegal measures to produce useful musical resources.
- 1.6 The musical measures adopted by individual local congregations sometimes erode the theological soundness or aesthetic quality of the music that is sung in our congregations.
- 1.7 The Diocesan Council of the Diocese of Grahamstown requests that consideration be given to the production of a new hymnal.
2. **Resolves** that the Metropolitan be respectfully requested to establish a Commission to begin the process of producing such a hymnal which reflects both the diversity of our Province and its rich musical traditions.

⁸⁵ *Motions and Resolutions from Provincial Synod 2005 2–9 July* (Cape Town: CPSA, 2005), 36–37.

⁸⁶ *Motions and Resolutions from Provincial Synod 2005*, 85.

worship and rejected it wholesale. The implications for congregations are still being felt across the globe. Parishes have split over whether music should be led professionally or by amateurs.⁸⁷

In Southern African Anglicanism, the charismatic movement gathered momentum when Bill Burnett was elected archbishop in 1974.⁸⁸ Because the movement emerged at the same time as many of the liturgical changes of the later twentieth century, some people have mistakenly associated charismatic music with liturgical change. Although some decisions regarding liturgical change were influenced by charismatic developments, liturgical change was not precipitated by charismatic clergy nor inspired by their teachings.

In the Diocese of Cape Town a number of parishes were, and still are, directly affected by the charismatic movement. In particular, the evangelically minded clergy were drawn to the contemporary teachings of charismatic theologians. Their parishes tended to adopt charismatic music genres in an effort to inspire Christians to renew their lives. In Anglican parishes, charismatic music was often included alongside traditional hymnody. The new music was well received in some of the white parishes and did much to revive those churches.

Most critics of charismatic music tend to focus on its overt appeal to emotionalism. At the 1979 South African Christian Leadership Assembly conference, the apex of the charismatic movement in southern Africa, one of the speakers, David MacGregor (dean of Pretoria), warned that music with too strong a beat could build frenzy in worship.⁸⁹ Nonetheless, more moderate charismatic musicians did influence congregational music positively by introducing new hymns and songs. In 1981 Christ Church in Kenilworth, and its associated parishes, produced a worship song book called *Praise the Lord* for this purpose. One of the most important aspects of the book is that it was intended as an ecumenical resource. Thus, hymnody from across the denominational spectrum was included. Choruses (a genre generally linked with the charismatic movement) also comprised a large portion of the anthology. Because choruses do not usually have specific denominational associations, they tend to promote ecumenical cooperation in worship.

When *Praise the Lord* was used in Anglican contexts, it made available hymnody that was not published in *Hymns Ancient and Modern Revised*—for example, *Thine be the glory*. It also introduced congregations to modern classics such as *I am the bread of life* and *Open our eyes, Lord*. Much of the newer material came from the United States, and for the first time the largely British nature of Southern African Anglican worship was infiltrated by American trends. In essence, *Praise the Lord* was a local version of the popular books *Sounds of Living Water*, *Fresh Sounds*, and *Cry Hosanna*. A number of the arrangements were written by Tony Westwood, a musician at Christ Church.⁹⁰ Apart from these arrangements, there appears to be no local content. The musicians who designed and assembled this hymn book were not professionals, in the sense that they made a living in music (in fact, Tony Westwood and Chris Dare both trained as medical

⁸⁷ Andrew Wilson-Dickson, *The Story of Christian Music: From Gregorian Chant to Black Gospel: An Authoritative Illustrated Guide to All the Major Traditions of Music for Worship* (Oxford: Lion, 1992), 241–42.

⁸⁸ Bill Burnett (1917–94) was the first South African-born archbishop. He was elected in 1974 and retired in 1981.

⁸⁹ Interview with Christopher Gregorowski (Bergvliet, Cape Town, March 18, 2010).

⁹⁰ Els, *100 Years of God's Grace*, 78.

doctors). Such lay-led projects are a clear indication of how the church's program of encouraging the laity to take an active role in parish leadership was bearing fruit.

The popularity of *Praise the Lord* was unprecedented. Churches across the entire subcontinent bought it in vast numbers, and it enjoyed pride of place next to each denomination's official hymn book. One of the most important features of the book is that the songs were designed for full congregational participation. Of course, such participation complemented the liturgical movement's call for full and active participation by everyone in the congregation, which is why the liturgical renewal has often been associated with charismatic music.

Between the mid-1970s and the 1980s, while numbers at traditional Evensong services were declining fairly rapidly, charismatic churches began introducing evening youth services with music accompanied by worship bands. At Christ Church in Kenilworth, and its associate churches, the "Parish Praise" initiative was established in the mid-1970s. These services were aimed at the youth and were accompanied by an orchestra. The music was a combination of hymnody and contemporary songs with arrangements by Tony Westwood and John Birch, while Chris Dare conducted the orchestra.⁹¹ St. Thomas's in Rondebosch began experimenting with a similar service called "Prayer and Praise" on Sunday evenings with contemporary music.⁹² Other parishes established smaller bands with piano, guitars, and sometimes drums. Thus, the emancipation of the laity in the new experimental liturgies also began to liberate amateur musicians.

Increasingly, churches found organ accompaniment undesirable or old-fashioned. The stubbornness of both organists and clergy resulted in many unfortunate arguments within the church in this regard. Some clergy tried to introduce a balance of both modern and traditional music and were hurt when their organists refused to play newer styles of music. Organists, in turn, were hurt because they had not been consulted about the changes and felt that the Anglican musical tradition was being threatened. In most cases, neither organists nor clergy were particularly graceful in their dealings with one another. Eventually some organists were forced to leave, or resigned, because they were unwilling to change.⁹³ In these cases, a worship band was often recruited to lead the singing.

The highly polarized nature of arguments between traditional and contemporary musicians may have been exacerbated by the fact that Archbishop Burnett seemed to sanction charismatic worship at the expense of traditional Anglican services. Even if this was not his intention, it appears that a number of clergy and musicians interpreted his actions as such.⁹⁴ The international director of the RSCM, Lionel Dakers, commented upon the situation as it had developed by the 1980s:

⁹¹ Els, *100 Years of God's Grace*, 77 and 103.

⁹² Interview with Christopher Gregorowski (Bergvliet, Cape Town, March 18, 2010).

⁹³ John Bertalot discusses this situation in his report on music in South Africa; see Bertalot, "Report on John Bertalot's Tour of South Africa for the Royal School of Church Music, Thursday 26 July through Monday 27 August, 1990" (RSCM Archives).

⁹⁴ A number of interviewees expressed their disappointment in Archbishop Burnett's handling of issues around the charismatic movement. In some ways he seems to have polarized churches rather than reconciling them. Nevertheless, church historians would be able to assess the archbishop's contribution better than I can.

I was very concerned by the gulf which exists between the “traditionalists” and the charismatics. It seemed to me that some of the traditional elements, especially those identified with the RSCM, were as arrogant towards the charismatics as they seemed to be towards the traditionalists! It therefore seems deplorable that a “we and they” situation exists which can only make the situation divisive, whereas music ought to be drawing us all together because of the common language it speaks.⁹⁵

John Bertalot also makes mention of the uneasy relationships between charismatics and traditionalists as late as 1990.⁹⁶ Such “rivalry,” of course, is not an exclusively South African problem. That these two musicians make mention of this situation says as much about their own situations in Britain and the United States as it does about South Africa. Although this was largely a white problem, rather than a South African one, some coloured parishes were affected by the division too, but black parishes were dealing with problems of their own. Thus, charismatic music, imported from America in particular, was essentially a white and coloured phenomenon.

In parishes where the charismatic influence was only moderate, morning services tended to focus on congregational singing with newer liturgies, while traditional Evensong was usually led by the choir using the South African version of the Book of Common Prayer.⁹⁷ In this way traditional and contemporary music shared equal support. This appears to have been the most common trend among parishes during the 1970s and early 1980s.

Music in Anglican Consciousness

Besides analyzing spiritual and political trends that have affected music, it is helpful to gauge what the public perception of music and musical standards was during periods of liturgical change. The national Anglican quarterly publication *Seek* periodically included articles concerning music, two of which are of particular interest. In January 1986, Christopher Molyneux, a prominent parish musician in Cape Town, published a substantial critique of music in the province.⁹⁸ He discussed, among other things, the shortage of competent organists and the role of the church musician in worship. He also criticized Canon 33 of the province’s constitution,⁹⁹ pointing out that to leave music in the hands of the bishops only resulted in lax standards. In essence, his article was a criticism not of the bishops’ lack of musical knowledge, but of their inability to delegate the issue of music in the church to people with the appropriate qualifications.

The article sparked much debate in *Seek* from both clergy and laity. Owen Franklin, also a musician, wrote that “much of the blame for the present appalling standards of church music in all but a few [choirs] can be laid at the doors of our theological colleges. The clergy have simply not been educated in liturgy and music”¹⁰⁰—a state of affairs that continues to this day. In August

⁹⁵ Lionel Dakers, letter to the archbishop of Cape Town, July 16, 1984 (Anglican Archives, AB 2546/R17).

⁹⁶ Bertalot, “Report.”

⁹⁷ St. Stephen’s in Pinelands was a classic example of this approach.

⁹⁸ *Seek*, January 1986: 4–5.

⁹⁹ Canon 33.4: Hymns: No Hymn or Collection of Hymns shall be hereafter introduced into the Public Services of any congregation of this Province without the consent of the Bishop of the Diocese.

¹⁰⁰ *Seek*, March 1986: 8.

1986, a headline announced a “music breakthrough.”¹⁰¹ The article spoke about David Pass, a postgraduate student at the University of the Witwatersrand, who had just completed a Ph.D. thesis entitled “A Theological Theory of Music in the Church.” He hoped that his “theology” of music would result in an international breakthrough. His thesis was published three years after he graduated¹⁰² but was not readily available on the South African market and did not make the impact he had hoped for. Nevertheless, Pass’s work was revolutionary, as it argued that no particular style of music is sacred as such; in other words, there is no reason why traditional hymnody and modern songs should not be used in the same service.

Some letters in *Seek* lamented the state of church music in parishes where the resident organist had either retired or been dismissed in favor of a worship band. Usually the writers of these letters equated liturgical change with the charismatic revival, reviling the changes in both language and music. In white circles, then, it seems that there was considerable dissatisfaction with parish music. No mention is ever made of black choirs and their progress.

Music at St. George’s Cathedral since 1950

The high standard of music established during the early twentieth century continued to be upheld by Barry Smith throughout his tenure as organist at St. George’s Cathedral (1964–2006). Newer liturgies were introduced gradually, and Matins eventually gave way to a congregational Eucharist.

The choir of men and boys continued to flourish. Maintaining a choir with a boy treble line has not been easy, however. Contemporary schoolchildren have demanding schedules that preclude the vigorous training required for high standards of singing. To exacerbate the situation, the governing body of St. George’s Grammar School has been less than helpful in its attitude toward the cathedral and its choir.¹⁰³ Despite these obstacles, Smith managed to uphold a fine tradition of singing.

In 1967 the boys rehearsed on Monday and Thursday mornings for 40 minutes, and on Friday evenings for up to two hours. On Sundays they were expected to be at the cathedral early to warm up for Matins and Evensong. Additionally, they were required to sing at four extra services: confirmation, Nine Lessons and Carols, St. Cecilia’s Day, and the RSCM massed choir festival.¹⁰⁴ At times the repertoire of the choir has been very demanding, including some of the toughest settings of the canticles and the best English anthems.¹⁰⁵ The choir has continued to flourish under the direction of new cathedral organists, although it is no longer exclusively male—girls and women altos have been welcomed.

Toward the end of the 1960s, Smith created a choir of adult singers to attempt some of the bigger works in the sacred repertory. The St. George’s Singers, still in existence today, have

¹⁰¹ *Seek*, August 1986: 2.

¹⁰² See David Pass, *Music and the Church: A Theology of Church Music* (Nashville, Tenn.: B&H Publishers, 1989).

¹⁰³ Interview with Barry Smith (Cape Town, Feb. 1, 2010).

¹⁰⁴ All of this information comes from a “Choir Prospectus” dated January 1967 (Anglican Archives AB1363/C36 [file 2]).

¹⁰⁵ Interview with Barry Smith (Cape Town, Feb. 1, 2010).

premiered a number of South African works and toured extensively. When the monthly orchestral Mass was introduced at the cathedral several decades ago, the St. George's Singers presented the great Western Mass settings with an ad hoc orchestra. These services, held on the last Sunday of every month, were well attended and financially supported.¹⁰⁶ Today the orchestral Masses continue as part of the parish Eucharist service. However, they are usually sung by the Cathedral University Singers (established by David Orr).

In the late 1980s, Smith and the cathedral council proposed that a specialist music school for pupils between the ages of eight and fourteen should be created in the neighboring buildings in the cathedral close.¹⁰⁷ Proponents of the school, including Archbishop Desmond Tutu, envisaged a place where children of all races could interact and work together—foreshadowing what South African schools would become in the future. The idea was a noble one, but despite much work on the part of all parties involved, there was not enough capital to establish the school. However, within four years of the initial idea, schools throughout the country were beginning to accept children of all races.

During the tenures of Keith Jewel (organist at St. George's from 1952 to 1963) and Barry Smith, South African composers were commissioned to write works for the cathedral choirs. Among others, John Joubert (b. 1927), Peter Klatzow (b. 1945), Stephen Carletti (b. 1965), and Grant McLachlan (b. 1956) have contributed works to the regular repertoire of the cathedral. Although much of this music has been written in the British cathedral style, a number of individual works have incorporated specifically South African elements (rhythmic rather than harmonic),¹⁰⁸ for example, Carletti's *African Canticles*¹⁰⁹ and Klatzow's *Prayers and Dances from Africa*.¹¹⁰ In the past ten years or so, the cathedral has gradually introduced elements of African music into its worship. The final Eucharist for the Afro-Anglicanism Conference,¹¹¹ for example, was celebrated in three languages (English, Afrikaans, and Xhosa) and included both Western hymnody and African church songs. Marimbas were featured in some of the songs and hymns. A similar pattern has been used fairly frequently since then for diocesan services, particularly consecrations. An Evensong recorded for the BBC in 2005 included marimba music before the service. While all the rest of music in the service was by South African composers, there was no conscious effort to include music by black or even coloured composers (of which there are many). The program included the *African Preces and Responses* (Barry Smith), *African Canticles* (Stephen Carletti), and *How bright those glorious spirits shine* (Peter Klatzow).

¹⁰⁶ Interview with Barry Smith (Cape Town, Feb. 1, 2010).

¹⁰⁷ For specific details about the school, see *St George's Music School* (Anglican Archives AB1363/C36).

¹⁰⁸ For more detailed analysis of some of these works, see Andrew-John Bethke, "Repertoire Performed in Parishes of the Diocese of Cape Town: Congregational Music and Local Developments, 2009–2012," *Journal of Musical Arts in Africa* (2015).

¹⁰⁹ Carletti explored African rhythms in the Magnificat and adapted a South African freedom song for the Nunc Dimittis.

¹¹⁰ Although Klatzow did not actually seek to mimic African rhythms or melodies, he used texts from Desmond Tutu's *An African Prayer Book* in the work. The dances, set between the choral sections, were originally for brass ensemble, but he later adapted them for marimba. This adaptation has given the work more of an African flavor.

¹¹¹ Pew leaflet for closing Eucharist of Afro-Anglican Conference, Jan. 24, 1995 (Anglican Archives AB 2668).

Music in Parish Churches since 1950

Much of the above discussion also encompasses parish music. Many South African churches were affected by the charismatic movement. Those that were not progressed organically toward a milder form of Anglo-Catholicism—that is, much of the outward ceremonial remained, but the theological aspects of Tractarianism largely disappeared. In some of these parishes, popular choruses are sung side by side with traditional hymnody, mostly accompanied by the organ or piano. Most churches have a worship band playing in the evening service. Many of these play repertoire from the *Songs of Fellowship* series. Choral music continues in a number of parishes,¹¹² but the membership of most choirs began to dwindle by the late 1990s.

The effect of social and liturgical changes on the musical trends of parishes cannot be underestimated. Liturgically, the shift to weekly Eucharistic worship has meant that most families attend the main morning service. Social developments, particularly the introduction of television in South Africa in the mid-1970s, also had an alarming effect on attendance at evening services. Some Sunday parish evening services were abandoned altogether, and church meetings on certain days had to be changed because of popular weekly television shows.¹¹³ Attendance at weekly sung Evensong gradually diminished, but choirs were not dying. Parishes continued to present such choral Office services for many years, until congregations became smaller than the choirs. Today, a number of churches, such as St. Michael and All Angels in Observatory, host a monthly or quarterly sung Evensong. Otherwise, most parishes promote youth services on Sunday evenings.

By the early 1980s, liturgical dance had been accepted into parish worship. A pew leaflet for a confirmation service held at St. John's in Wynberg as early as 1981 included mention of liturgical dance. Apart from the dance items, however, the service was fairly traditional; among the congregational items were hymns, including the plainsong versions of *Come, Holy Ghost*, and a Eucharist setting.¹¹⁴

One trend in South African churches is the use of illegally photocopied sheet music. The RSCM sent a warning to its South African customers in the 1980s, stating that if the British government imposed sanctions against South Africa, it would be forced to stop its imports.¹¹⁵ This never did happen, but it must have worried local musicians. As the rand lost value in the 1980s and imported sheet music became increasingly expensive, many choirmasters, band leaders, and organists began photocopying music illegally, believing that their Christian Copyright Licence covered photocopied music. The rand's value did not improve in subsequent

¹¹² In 1987, when the RSCM Cape Town sent out a survey to parishes about combined choral festivals, 19 of the 22 parishes that responded had active choirs. See "Summary of Results of the Questionnaire about the Annual Festival," 1987.

¹¹³ In particular, no Bible studies or meetings could be scheduled for Tuesday evenings because *Dallas* aired at that time. Interview with Christopher Gregorowski (Bergvliet, Cape Town, March 18, 2010).

¹¹⁴ *Service of Confirmation and First Communion Celebrated by the Most Reverend Philip Russell Archbishop of Cape Town on Sunday 29th November 1981 at 7P.M.* (Anglican Archives AB 1363).

¹¹⁵ Letter from the RSCM publications department to all South African customers, dated September 1985. In a letter dated April 11, 1986, Lionel Dakers (international RSCM director) and Vincent Waterhouse (RSCM secretary) noted that they were unaware that the above-mentioned letter had been sent to RSCM patrons in South Africa, and apologized for any misunderstandings it had caused (RSCM Archives).

years and the trend continued. It is safe to assume that the publications of the local RSCM branches toward the end of the 1980s were designed to curb this inclination. Indeed, a stronger local publication and compositional base may have improved the situation. In 1990 John Bertalot dedicated a whole subsection of his report on South African church music to illegal photocopies.¹¹⁶

One other trend that Bertalot highlighted was the decline in the involvement of children in church music.¹¹⁷ The RSCM has consistently encouraged children to become involved in church choirs, but so far their work has not paid tangible dividends. Too many choir directors lack the charisma to retain younger choristers, who increasingly chose sports and other entertainment over choral singing. In fact, youth participation in the Anglican Church of Southern Africa as a whole is low.

Soon after the publication of *APB* in 1989, Geoff Quinlan, erstwhile suffragan bishop of Cape Town, published *A Manual for Worship Leaders*. This little resource was written to educate laity and improve the standard of worship at the parish level. Clergy had found that since the emancipation of the laity, many ordinary people wanted to participate in leading parish worship. Most laity had little, if any, training in worship, and as a result the manual proved exceptionally influential. Bishop Quinlan, who is a creative leader, advocated the use of both hymns and worship songs, but stressed that only the best of both genres should be used in corporate worship. In particular, he discouraged the use of hymns and songs that stressed personal faith in the gathering rite, noting that the church is a community of faith. He also advocated the use of portions of longer hymns for particular circumstances, rather than the whole set of stanzas.¹¹⁸ One of the most obvious influences of his book is the replacement of the Gloria with two or three hymns or songs. The bishop is careful to note that the Gloria should not be omitted too regularly, since it in itself is a fine worship song.¹¹⁹ Nevertheless, a number of parishes now omit the Gloria completely to make room for a worship session at the beginning of the service.

Conclusion

The past 50 years have witnessed massive theological, liturgical, and social changes in South Africa, all of which have affected Anglican church music in some way. The country's former political system of apartheid and its segregated history have shaped contemporary musical developments in traditionally black parishes, while trends in Western Christianity have tended to influence white and coloured parishes. Other social developments, such as the introduction of television, have also negatively affected attendance levels in parishes and, more important, choirs and music groups. The largely homogenous style of the 1950s has given way to a wide variety of styles and standards in parishes, which are beginning to reflect the diversity of South African society much more clearly than the old style did.

¹¹⁶ Bertalot, "Report" (RSCM Archives), 5.

¹¹⁷ Bertalot, "Report" (RSCM Archives), 9.

¹¹⁸ Geoff Quinlan, *A Manual for Worship Leaders*, rev. ed. (Cape Town: Geoff Quinlan, 2006), 29–31.

¹¹⁹ Quinlan, *A Manual for Worship Leaders*, 44 and 50.